

CHAPTER 05

Comparative study of Pāṇini & Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya

I Pāṇini & his *Aṣṭādhyāyī* – A brief sketch

Pāṇini (500 BC) the illustrious author of the *Aṣṭādhyāyī* is succeeded by Kātyāyana or Vararuci, the author of the *Vārttikas* and Patañjali, the author of the great exegesis *Mahābhāṣya*.¹

Pāṇini's *Aṣṭādhyāyī* is divided into 8 books (अध्याय), each sub-divided in 4 quarters (पाद) to suit the grammatical functions. Each quarter consists of topics (प्रकरण) which contain rules (सूत्र). The rules are formed by exhaustive and still concise language. Here below its contents are given in brief.²

In the 1st book, most of the संज्ञा along with the परिभाषा have been discussed. Moreover, necessary rules for composition with regard to the two types of पाद of the verbal roots (आत्मनेपद and परस्मैपद) have been dealt with. Some of the rules regarding the कारक cases of cases have been explained.

In the first two quarters of the 2nd book, the rules regarding the समास (compounds) have been given. In the third quarter, the remaining uses of cases in the कारक, etc. are discussed. In the fourth quarter, some compounds like द्विगु, etc. and the substitutes of the verbal roots have been explained. The quarter ends with the discussion of the elision of affixes.

The 3rd and the 4th books contain the discussion of the तद्धित Secondary derivatives), while the 5th book continues with the discussion of the तद्धित is continued.

In the first quarter of the 6th book, Pāṇini deals with the rules of अभ्यास (reduplication) of the verbal roots and the rules of combination (सन्धि) and those of accents. In the second quarter of the book, the accents of the compounds are discussed. In the third quarter, the changes in the first member of the compounds are dealt with. While in the fourth quarter, the changes about letters, when affixes are added to the अङ्ग (base), are elaborated.

Like the fourth quarter of the 6th book, in the 7th book also, there is a description of the changes occurring in the base due to the addition of the affixes to it.

The complete 7 books and the first quarter of the 8th book are known as सपादसप्ताध्यायी, while remaining three quarters of the 8th book bear the name त्रिपादी. The order of the rules in the त्रिपादी bears a great importance in the functions of Pāṇini's grammar, because in the last three quarters the succeeding rule is invalid with reference to the preceding one. The second quarter of the 8th book, (the first one of the त्रिपादी) starts with the well-known परिभाषा rule – पूर्वत्रासिद्धम्. It means that let त्रिपादी (the last three quarters) of the अष्टाध्यायी be considered as invalid with reference to सपादसप्ताध्यायी (the first seven books along with the first quarter of the 8th book) and in त्रिपादी (the last three quarters of the 8th book) too, the subsequent rule be considered invalid with reference to the preceding one. In the first quarter of the त्रिपादी, the rules regarding accentuation, लोप (the elision) of some occasion (संयोगान्त) and others are discussed.

In the last quarter of the त्रिपादी, the topics like णत्व, (retro flexing) etc. are discussed.

II Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya & his *Sārasvata-vyākaraṇam* or *Sārasvata-prakriyā*

Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya (= AS), the author of the commentary on the Sārasvata aphorisms of Narendrācārya (NC) is well known through his only work, the *Sārasvata-prakriyā*. He flourished in 13th cent.

He has written his commentary on the 562 Sārasvata aphorisms of NC who has given the aphorisms in 13 chapters called पाद or प्रकरणम्. AS deals with the Sārasvata rules in total 60 chapters in 03 Parts (वृत्ति) of his work.

The first Part comprising 17 chapters, discusses technical terms followed by the rules of coalescing, nominal declensions, युष्मदस्मदी, Special Substitutes (आदेशविशेषविधिः), Feminine Affixes, कारक, Compounds, Secondary Derivatives. It contains 287 aphorisms, 54 corrective statements, 54 stanzas and 46 aphorisms of Pāṇini, including 22 with a slight change.

The second Part consisting 34 chapters, deals exclusively with the verbal conjugations of the 10 groups of roots, followed by Causal formation, Desiderative formation, Frequentative/Intensive, Affecting Dropping of the Frequentative/Intensive suffix, Denominative, Regulating (the roots) to आत्मनेपद, Impersonal & Passive and Verbal terminations. It contains 185 aphorisms, 18 corrective statements, 25 stanzas (including 11 अनिट्कारिका) and 86 aphorisms of Pāṇini, including 68 with a slight change.

The third Part discusses with the Agentives in 09 chapters on Agentive suffixes, Province of Past Participles, Past Perfect Participles, Character/Behaviour, Agentives, Provinces Abstract noun, Potential Participles, Provinces of Feminine suffixes and Absolutive suffixes. It contains 90 aphorisms, 02 corrective statements, 18 stanzas and 17 aphorisms of Pāṇini, including 03 with a slight change.

Thus AS comments on 562 aphorisms out of 568 of the NC's *Sūtrapāṭha* and 75 corrective statements out of 90 of the Sārasvata school (which means that AS is not the author of the corrective statements). It is also clear that AS had Rāmacandraśeṣa's *Prakriyā-kaumudī* at his disposal as an aid model text for his composition to which he is indebted for the stanzas and also the aphorisms of Pāṇini, some of which are *verbatim* and some are modified a little.

His style is not only simple, concise and perfect but also convincing and consuming less effort and time. For this reason only, more than 20 commentaries are written on his *Sārasvata-prakriyā* and that too, just in 150 years.

III Available later texts on *Sārasvata-vyākaraṇam*

AS is further commented by the following commentators and all of them have tried to elaborate the less explained points and some times completing the declensions or verbal forms, just to make the system complete.

(01) Muni Candrakīrti's *Subodhikā* or *Dīpikā* (second quarter of 16th cent.), General survey

Candrakīrti (=CK) gives the etymology of the words like,

(01) ह्रस्व (under 2, 1/2) (short), दीर्घ (long) (under S. 2, 1/2) and प्लुत (prolated) (under S. 35, 3/4), (02) सवर्ण with its 48 varieties (under S. 2, 2/1), (03) प्रकृतिभाव as well as प्रगृह्य (under S. 32, 3/1), (04) पदान्तता as well as अपदान्तता (under S. 37, 4/1), (05) समासे as well as असमासे (under S. 65, 6/1), (06) *Niruktam* (its five-fold etymology) (under S. 64, 5/10), (07) विभक्ति (that by which the agent, the object and so on are separately presented) (under S. 65, 6/1), (08) nine pronouns like पूर्व and others (under S. 83, 6/3), (09) सोमपा (a god, the drinker of soma-juice) (under S. 92, 6/83), (10) सखि (a friend) (under S. 101, 6/96), (11) सर्व (Pronoun) (all) (under S. 240, 8/3), (12) सुश्री (one to whom (all) resort or serve) (under S. 109, 6/98), (13) निपात (under S. 218, 11/18), (14) उपसर्ग (prefix) (under S. 221, 11/14), (15) लिङ्ग (1) that by which the nouns are recognized as Masculine, Feminine and Neuter and (2) as the nouns only (under S. 239, 8/1), (16) आम्नेडितम् (that which is spoken or uttered twice or thrice) (under S. 240, 8/3), (17) अपत्ये (one because of whom, the father or the fatherhood is not lost or deviated) (in wider sense, sons and grandsons - पुत्र-पौत्रादि as well as disciples and grand disciples - शिष्य-प्रशिष्यादि) (under S. 269, 9/1), (18) भाव (making an abstract noun) (under S. 283, 9/12), (19) आख्यात (verb in two ways: (I) through which the forms of the roots are derived (निष्पद्यन्ते) or (II) those, which express (आचक्षते) the action of the agent (under S. 288, 12/1), (20) धातु (root which possesses the meaning (under S. 289, 12/90) and (21) विधि (Optativeness or Potential) as Injunction (under S. 305, (12/3)).

CK does not repeat the aphorisms already commented earlier, but mentions them with a key word.

CK an enlists the groups like त्यदादि (त्यद्, तद्, यद्, एतद्,

इदम्, द्वि, किम्, युष्मद् and अस्मद्), the ten roots indicated in ग्रहाम् (Pā. 6/1/16) (under S. 393 13/73), the group of मुच् and other roots (under S. 437, 12/151).

CK following AS's method, declines the nouns and pronouns in the popular method i.e. beginning from Nominative, Accusative, etc. up to the Vocative.

CK justifies the indicators (अनुबन्ध) like, न् (नुट्), उ (in असुङ्), (अ) of the roots belonging to आत्मनेपद. (under S. 383, 7/60), इ (used for the easy pronunciation), the nasal ङ् indicates the आत्मनेपद (S. 410, 12/125).

CK explains the optional aphorisms incorporated by AS with the help of the Pāṇinian terminology and language.

CK incorporates the Pāṇinian terms like, उदात्त etc. and सानुनासिक and निरनुनासिक.³

AS's incorporating 06 necessary technical terms like लघु etc., CK says: the passage is the case of borrowing from the *Prakriyā-kaumudī*.

CK gives the substitutes for each separately, wherever and whenever they occur.

CK sometimes refers to the other Schools of Sanskrit Grammar like, Kātantra and Hemacandra (under S. 144, 6/80), Kṣemendrācārya (under S. 201, 7/49).

CK explains the terms in all possible ways, as e.g. टि (the last consonant with its penultimate vowel preceded by a consonant), अप्रसिद्धः (not popular) i.e. अप्रतितः (in a rare usage in the language).

CK explains the words of AS and recognises the predecessor with the word “some” (केचित्).

CK in his commentary cites a large number of quotations from *Śrīmad Bhagavat Gītā* (11/41) (under S. 22, 2/9), *Rāmarakṣāstotram* (under S. 83, 6/3), quotes *upaniṣad* (under S. 185, 6/54), *Raghuvaṁśa* (1/5) (under S. 221, 11/14), *Bhāgavata-mahāpurāṇa* (10/5/11) (under S. 244, 8/7), Kālidāsa’s *Kumārasaṁbhavam* (under S. 296, 12/66), and *Raghuvaṁśam* (under S. 221, 11/14), *Campūkathā* (under S. 296, 12/66), *Ratnamālā* (under S. 296, 12/66), Ādiśaṅkara’s *Viṣṇuṣaṭpadī* (under S. 296, 12/66), *Pūrvamīmāṃsā*, Bhaṭṭi’s *Bhaṭṭikāvya* (*Rāvaṇavadham*) (under S. 419, 12/55), Māgha’s *Śiśupālavadham* (under S. 444, 12/88).

CK’s attempt to make the system complete and perfect is seen clearly under S. 244, 8/7 where he introduces a new aphorism in this school, and that aphorism is *chandasi* (though not in AS) which he explains with the illustrations.

(02) Vidvadvāra Rāmāśrama (1684 AD)

Rāmāśrama (=RM) being a student of the Pāṇinian School, finds the ample room to introduce almost all the Pāṇinian terms in the Sārasvata School by replacing the words like, सजातीय (homogeneous), etc. for सर्वर्णः and so on to make his explanation short.

RM following AS’s spirit of adopting the terms of the Pāṇinian School, explains the Sārasvata aphorisms.

RM many a times does not suffice any importance to its explanation.

(03) Jinacandra (1850 AD)

Jinacandra (=JC) writes brief explanations, yet he furnishes all required details of the grammar, whatever he finds most necessary. Thus he introduces the three varieties of the vowel अ as अ आ आः and instructs to understand the rest.

JC gives simple explanation.

JC follows AS in dividing the aphorism into two.

Anubhūtisvarūpācārya is exact in furnishing the well-known (Pāṇinian) technical terms like प्रत्याहार and justifies the Non-coalescing (असन्धि) of the vowels in the aphorism, to which Rāmāśrama adopts the same explanation.⁴

IV Anubhūtisvarūpācārya, as a bridge to connect the schools of Pāṇini & Narendrācārya

Anubhūtisvarūpācārya (=AS) is exact in furnishing and justifying the well-known (Pāṇinian) technical terms like प्रत्याहार, प्रकृतिभाव (असन्धि), तपरकरण, 06 terms like लघु, गुरु, अनुनासिक, etc.

AS explains the difficult words of the aphorisms like, य्वोः (the dual form of यु (dual) of इ, भवत् (भवान् (Respect form, you) - from भा - भाति (2P, to shine) + अवत् (डवत्), the illustrious one, वुः (under S. 451) (the Ablative sing. of combination of उ + ऋ (under S. 451, 12/166).

AS furnishes exact areas of the the indicators like, उ indicates the suffixes like वतु and ऋ indicates the suffixes like शतृ.

AS justifies the तपरकरणम् under the aphorism अरेदो नामिनो गुणः (under S. 8, 9/35), सार्वधातुक and आर्धधातुक (Pā. 2/4/56) in the form of a statement explaining the terms for the group of four (Present Tense, Imperfect Past, Imperative and Potential) and the rest respectively, (under S. 355, 9/27),

AS (the author ग्रन्थकार, as noted by CK) lays down the regulations regarding the province of आत्मनेपद that it is enjoined when the fruit or result of an action goes to the agent (आत्मगामि) (under S. 291, 12/71) which has no difference from the explanation of स्वरितञितः कर्त्रभिप्राये क्रियाफले ॥ पा० १/३/७२ ॥

Just at the commencement under the discussion of the morae (मात्रा) (not included in the Sārasvata School), AS incorporates the last aphorism लोकाच्छेषस्य सिद्धिः यथा मात्रादेः and (13/89) justifies the word लोकतः as “from other texts of Sanskrit grammar”, which definitely indicates that of Pāṇini who speaks of the मात्रा in his Śikṣā.⁵

AS incorporates the aphorisms of Pāṇinian School of Sanskrit grammar, yet many of them are presented in the form of corrective statements (*Vārtika*) such as,

- (१) अजेरार्धधातुके वी वक्तव्यः वसादौ वा ॥ तु० पा० २/४/५६ ॥ (under S. 395, 9/27)
- (२) इषुसहलुभरिषरुषामनपि तस्येद्वा वक्तव्यः ॥ तु० पा० ७/३/७७ ॥ (under S. 365, 12/29)
- (३) उषविद्जागृणामाम्वा वक्तव्यः ॥ तु० पा० ३/१/३८ ॥ (under S. 368, 12/27).

- (४) पतेर्देः पुमागमो वाच्यः ॥ तु° पा° ७/४/१९ ॥ (under S. 379, 12/128)
 (५) फणादिनामेत्वपूर्वलोपौ वा वाच्यौ ॥ तु° पा° ६/४/१२४ ॥, (under S. 380, 12/154)
 (६) वम एत्वपूर्वलोपौ वा वाच्यौ ॥ तु° पा° ६/४/१२४ ॥, (under S. 380, 12/154), etc.

AS has incorporated quite a large number of optional aphorisms like, लुकि न तन्निमित्तम् (under S. 164, 6/11), which are mostly a type of aphorisms with a slight alteration of either Pāṇinan or Kātantra or Hemacandra School. तन्त्र (under S. 366, 13/71) (the term frequently used in the *Mahābhāṣya* in the sense of a usage intended to be adopted in more than one place,

AS quoting the कारिका-

लुम्पेदवश्यमः कृत्ये तुं काममनसोरपि।

समो वा हिततयोमांसस्य पचि युङ्घजोः ॥८२॥

(under S. 547, 13/66) refers to the grammarians (शाब्दिकाः) i.e. given in the *Kāśikā* on Pāṇini.

AS enumerates at every occasion the groups of words or roots like, nine (five समान + four सन्ध्यक्षर) vowels, यञ् and others. (under S. 550, 13/59).

AS declines the nouns and pronouns in the popular method i.e. beginning from Nominative, Accusative, etc. up to the Vocative.

AS divides the aphorisms into two (योगविभाग) such as,

१. ह य व र ल - ञ ण न ड म - झ ढ ध घ भ - ज ड द ग ब - ख फ छ ठ थ - च ट त क प - श ष स and आद्यन्ताभ्याम्। (under S. 6, 1/6).

२. स्त्रीयां यजां भावे क्तिः (under S. 550, 13/59), स्त्रीयां यजाम् ।
and भावे क्तिः ।

There is only one case where AS commenting upon the aphorism त्रिचतुरोः स्त्रियां तिसृचतसृवत् (7/19) states the substitutes तिसृ and चतस्रः to be declined like those ending in ऋ which seems like justifying the mistaken aphorism with वत् at the end, because only तिस्र चतस्र words would have served with the purpose the help of Pāṇini (7/2/99).⁶

The aphorisms of Pāṇinian school are incorporated in the *Sārasvata-prakriyā* with necessary changes i.e. transforming the terminology and adding word or words of succession.

- (१) परापूर्व अपतावुपसर्गिफस्य लत्वं वाच्यम् । (under S. 388, 12/115) - उपसर्गस्यायतौ ॥ पा० ८/२/१९ ॥
- (२) दयतेर्णादौ दिग्यादेशो द्वित्वाभावश्च वक्तव्यः (under S. 388, 12/115) - दयतेर्दिगि लिटि ॥ पा० ७/४/९ ॥
- (३) द्युतादिभ्यो लुङि वा परस्मैपदं वाच्यम् । (under S. 389, 12/37) - द्युद्भ्यो लुङि ॥ पा० १/३/९१ ॥
- (४) व्यथतेर्णादौ पूर्वस्य संप्रसारणं वक्तव्यम् । (under 390, 12.129) - व्यथो लिटि ॥ पा० ७/४/६८ ॥
- (५) गुहेरुपधाया ऊद्गुणहेतौ स्वरे (under S. 392, 12/130) - ऊदुपधाया गोहः ॥ पा० ६/४/८९ ॥

AS correlates the terms of the Sārasvata School with those of Pāṇini like,

- (१) वर्तमाने (under S. 295, 12/2) - पाणिनीयानां लङिति संज्ञा ।
- (२) विधिसंभावनयोः (under S. 305, 12/3) - पाणिनीयानां लिङिति संज्ञा ।
- (३) आशीःप्रेरणयोः (under S. 309, 12/4) - पाणिनीयानां लोट् संज्ञा ।
- (४) अणद्यतनेऽतीते (under S. 311, 12/5) - पाणिनीयानां लङ् संज्ञा ।

- 1 वाक्यकारं वररुचिं भाष्यकारं पतञ्जलिम् ।
पाणिनिं सूत्रकारं च प्रणतोऽस्मि मुनित्रयम् ॥
- 2 This brief description is based on Dr. S. S. Bhawe's article published in the *Svādhyāya* journal of the Oriental Institute, Vadodara.
- 3 अ. सन्ध्यक्षराणि यथा समानानामेव संधिना कृत्वा एषां निष्पत्तिः ॥ सुबोधिका पूर्वाद्धि पृष्ठ १५ ॥
ब. यदा समानानां व्यञ्जनानां च संधौ मध्ये वर्तन्ते इति सन्ध्यक्षराणि इति सन्ध्यक्षरसिद्धिः ॥ सुबोधिका पूर्वाद्धि पृष्ठ १५ ॥
क. एतेषां सन्ध्यक्षराणामष्टचत्वारिंशद् भेदा भवन्ति । यथा चतुर्णां सन्ध्यक्षराणां दीर्घप्लुतभेदादष्ट । तेषां चाष्टानां प्रत्येकमुदात्तानुदात्तस्वरितभेदाच्चतुर्विंशतिः । तेषां च सानुनासिकनिरनुनासिक-भेदादष्टचत्वारिंशदिति ॥ सुबोधिका पूर्वाद्धि पृष्ठ १५ ॥
- 4 अ. अइउऋलृ समानाः ॥ १.१ ॥
ब. अनेन प्रत्याहारग्रहणाय वर्णाः परिगण्यन्ते ।
- 5 अ. लोकाच्छेषस्य सिद्धिः ॥ १३.८९ ॥
ब. अर्धमात्रा तु कण्ठ्या स्यादेकारैकारयोर्भवेत् ॥
ओकारौकारयोर्मात्रा तयोर्विवृतसंवृतम् ॥ पा० शि० १९ ॥
संवृतं मात्रिकं ज्ञेयं विवृतं तु द्विमात्रिकम् ।
घोषा वा संवृताः सर्वे अघोषा विवृताः स्मृताः ॥ पा० शि० २० ॥
- 6 त्रिचुतरोः स्त्रियां तिसृचतसृवत् । त्रिचतुरोः स्त्रियां तिसृचतसृ । ऋवदित्यव्ययम् । स्त्रियां वर्तमानयोस्त्रिचतुर्शब्दयोस्त्रिसृचतसृ इत्येतावादेशौ भवतः ऋकारश्च ऋवत् ॥ सुबोधिका पूर्वाद्धि पृष्ठ १६० ॥
- 7 अजेरार्धधातुके वी वक्तव्यः वसादौ वा ॥ तु० पा० २/४/५६ ॥ एतच्च विभक्तिचतुष्टयं सार्वधातुकं परमार्धधातुकसंज्ञं पाणिनीयानाम् ।