

CHAPTER 02

Naredrācārya & his *Sūtra-pāṭha* A textual Analysis

I Life & Date

Though the *Sārasvata-vārttikas* are said to be authored by Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya (= AS) and though the tradition supports and even makes him the direct recipient of the revelation of the *sūtras*, it is Narendrācārya (= NC) (as per the discussion in the last pages of the previous chapter) who authored the *Sārasvata* aphorisms after obtaining the grace of the Goddess Sarasvatī, just like the system of Pāṇini who obtained 14 aphorisms from Maheśvara.¹

Viṭṭhalācārya² refers to NC's name. His commentary called *Prakriyākaumudīprasāda* is a praise-worthy work. He is dated in 1548-49 AD. He is the son of Nṛsiṃhācārya and the grandson of Rāmkrṣṇācārya. His son is Lakṣmidharācārya.

Candrakīrti (= CK) (1545-1553 AD) ascribes strongly the authorship of the *Sārasvata* aphorisms to NC and not to AS saying that the word शुभम् (promoting happiness i.e. easy and simple) indicates the making of this grammar easy and simple by AS. This makes it clear that NC is the *Sūtrakāra* and AS is the *Prakriyākāra*.³

Kṣemendra (first half of 16th cent.) at the end of his commentary on the *Sārasvata-prakriyā* of AS writes the colophon, "Thus ends the *Ṭippaṇa* written by Kṣemendra, on the *Sārasvata* grammar of Narendrācārya,"⁴ thereby declaring NC the author of the *Sārasvata*. Kṣemendra is

critically commented upon by Dhaneśvara (1595 AD) in his *Kṣemendra-ṭippaṇa-khaṇḍanam*.⁵

Moreover Amṛtabhāratī (1496 AD) another commentator writes, “I, Amṛtabhāratī have written all that was clearly stated by Narendranagari (i.e. Narendrapuri *alias* Narendrācārya), all that declared by Vimalasarasvatī and whatever I understood through my own intellect.”⁶

Vimalasarasvatī,⁷ the predecessor of Amṛtabhāratī is a well-known grammarian of the Pāṇinian school and has written the *Rūpamālā* and flourished in 1350 AD.

AS has written his *Sārasvata-prakriyā* on the Sārasvata aphorism in 1350 AD.

“In addition to these names,” writes Belvalkar,⁸ “there could be mentioned a few others - such as Ratnākara, Nārāyaṇabhāratī, Kṣemaṅkara, Mahīdhara, etc., but we have had already a wearisome list of them, sufficient to indicate the course of development of the school since its origin in the 13th cent.”

Shastri Navala Kishor, the editor of Muni Candrakīrti's *Subodhikā* has mentioned the names of the commentators in the following order: (1) Muni Candrakīrti's *Subodhikā*, (2) Vāsudevabhāṭṭa's *Prasāda*, (3) Mādhava's *Madhavī*, (4) Jagannātha's *Sārapradīpikā*, (5) Kāśīnātha's *Śārasvatabhāsyam*, (6) Amṛtabhāratī's *Vivṛtti*, *Subodhikā* or *Subodhini*, (7) Megharatna's *Dhūṇḍhikā*, (8) Haṁsavijayagaṇi's *Sabdārthacandrikā* and (9) Rāmabhāṭṭa's *Vidvatprabodhini* or *Rāmabhāṭṭī*.⁹

Thus Narendrācārya *alias* Narendrasūri or Narendrasarasvatī is the original writer of the *Sārasvata-vyākaraṇam*. He must have flourished in the 10th cent.,¹⁰ on the strength of references to him in the commentaries on the *Sārasvata-vyākaraṇam* written by AS (13th cent.), Amṛtabhārati (1496 AD), Muni Candrakīrti (1545-1553 AD), Kṣemendra (first half of 16th cent. AD) and Viṭṭhaleśa *alias* Viṭṭhalācārya (1548-49 AD).

At the commencement of the Sārasvata aphorisms, NC salutes Lord Brahmā, Śiva, goddesses Sarasvatī and Lakṣmī, Lord Viṣṇu (हरि) and the deities of achievement.¹¹ Though this does not indicate the author's sect, it is clear that his devotion to Goddess Sarasvatī and Lakṣmī-Nṛsiṃha is revealed. It must be noted that AS also pays homage to Goddess Sarasvatī as well as to Lakṣmī-Nṛsiṃha.

II Works

The Sārasvata school of Sanskrit grammar comprises of aphoristic rules (सूत्र), list of words of similar operation (गणपाठ), list of roots (धातुपाठ), metarules (परिभाषा), corrective statements (वार्तिक) and stanzas (कारिका).

From among the above given list of works the Sārasvata aphorisms are the only text from the pen of NC, while the other works except the list of roots and the stanzas, are authored by AS. The list of roots is ascribed to Mādhava, while the stanzas seem to be incorporated from some different texts of Sanskrit grammar, esp. *Prakriyākaumudī* of Rāmacandra.

The accessories like, list of corrective statements to the *Sārasvatasūtrapāṭha* (*Vārttika*) and the *Uṇādi*

(*Gaṇapāṭha*), root list (*Dhātupāṭha*) are not provided by NC the author of the *Sārasvata* aphorisms, though it is a matter of surprise that AS has endeavored to incorporate and explain most of the accessories under relevant aphorisms.

He takes up 01 corrective statement: declaring the drop of the termination of Nominative as well as Accusative plural and Locative singular of the Vedic language, though here is corrective statement नान्ताददन्तताच्छन्दसि डिश्योर्वा लोपो वक्तव्यः (30) .

From the Deccan College (Pune) Ms No. 239 of 1892-95 of the *Sārasvatasūtrapāṭha* appended with the list of *Vārttikas*, it can be inferred that AS must have had the texts of those accessories in his possession.

It is NC's peculiar device that he takes of the group of the words and appends the word आदि (and others) to it to denote all the words of that group e.g.

दृशादेः पश्यादिः ॥१२/१४८॥ - दृश् ऋ सृ शद सद पा घ्रा ध्मा स्था म्ना दाण् एते दृशादयः । पश्य ऋच्छ धौ शीय सीद पिब जिघ्र धम तिष्ठ तिष्ठ मन यच्छ एते पश्यादयः ।

दादेरिः ॥१२/९४॥ - अपिद्वाधामाङोहाक्पिबसोस्थानामिकारो भवति किति ङिति हसे परे ।

(01) The *Uṇādi* aphorisms provide certain affixes to add on to the verbal roots to derive nominal bases. These rules are known as *uṇādi*, because the first rule enjoins the affix उण् (उ, making वृद्धि), to a series of roots to derive nominal bases such as, कृ + उण् (उ, making वृद्धि) = कारु (artisan), वा + उण् (उ) = वायु (wind), पा + उण् (उ) = पायु and so on.

The scholars are of different opinions about the authorship of the *uṇādi* aphorisms, even in the Pāṇinian school of Sanskrit grammar. According to some, they are authored by Śākaṭāyana and hence here, the *uṇādi* aphorisms must have been included from the text available to AS.¹²

(02) The important feature like the succession (अनुवृत्ति), requires the knowledge of the order of the original text of Sārasvata grammar, though the *Adhikāra* (like Pāṇini 1/3/11, 3/1/1-2, etc.), the असिद्धत्व (like Pāṇini 6/4/22) and other features of the Pāṇini aphorisms have no scope here, because the Sārasvata school titles each chapter according to the topics (अधिकार).

The word अनुवृत्ति (succession or chain) is derived from अनु + वृत् - वर्तते (1A to follow). When a word or words from the previous rule follow into the subsequent rule or rules for the sake of intended purpose, it is known as अनुवृत्ति. When a word or words from the previous rule follow into the subsequent rules without dropping any intervening rule is known as the अनुवृत्ति like the flow of a river. For e.g. the word स्वरे (followed by a vowel) has the succession in rules as follows:

(A)	इ	यं	स्वरे	(२/१)
	उ	वम्	"	(२/२)
	ऋ	रम्	"	(२/२)
	लृ	लम्	"	(२/४)

(B)	अ	इ	ए	(२/१३)
	"	उ	ओ	(२/१४)
	"	ऋ	अर्	(२/१५)
	"	लृ	अल्	(२/१५), etc.

Though the example of the succession called मण्डुकप्लुति (hop of a frog) is not accepted in the Sārasvata school.

(03) The Sārasvata school of Sanskrit grammar gives 90 corrective statements (*vārttika*), while Kātyāyana (of Pāṇinian school) has given about 1500 *vārttikas* on nearly 4000 rules of *Aṣṭādhyāyī*.

(04) The aphorisms are the most concise and firm as a *sūtra* means a short phrase or a small comprehensive group of words. The brevity is said to be the soul of the Sārasvata grammar. For the sake of brevity, NC has accepted the elliptical construction for the Sārasvata. Each rule of the Sārasvata is assumed to be a complete sentence, but seldom one comes across a rule with all its components expressively stated. However the words, which are actually not present in the rule, yet are to be understood as the components of the said rule, come in to the rule by the technique of *anuvṛtti*.

(05) The *Nipātana* rules – There are some rules in the Sārasvata aphorisms, which are known as the *nipātana* rules, like those famous in Pāṇinian tradition. They are sometimes implied (i.e. pointed out by commentators) and sometimes expressed.

They are designated to be declared when the words which are not divided by or in accord with the rules of the Sārasvata aphorisms (because it is an abridged and concise system).

The following stanza states the functions of the *Nipātana*-

अप्राप्तेः प्रापणं यत्र प्राप्तेर्पणमेव च ।
अधिकार्थविवक्षा च त्रयमेतन्निपातनम् ॥

III Devices in Sārasvata aphorisms

(01) Use of plural forms - In a peculiar sense NC has employed the plural forms. For example

- (a) रुदाम् ॥१२/७७॥ - रुदविदमुषग्रहिस्वपिप्रच्छः सः किद्वाच्यः ।
(b) मदाम् ॥१३/४१॥ - मदादीनाम् अः प्रत्ययो भवति भावादौ कर्तृवर्जिते ।

(02) The reading of a word again- NC's peculiar device that he reads again the word, however it comes through the chain technique to indicate a peculiar sense. For e.g.

- (a) साधनाधारयोश्च ॥५२६॥ (b) गत्यर्थदिकर्मकाच्च कर्तरि क्तः ॥५२७॥ (c) भावकार्ययोः ॥५२८॥..... स्त्रियां यजां भावे क्तः ॥५३६॥

(03) Mostly NC has used 04 cases in the Sārasvata aphorisms i.e. प्रथमा (Nominative), पञ्चमी (Ablative), षष्ठी (Genitive) and सप्तमी (Locative), with a clear understanding that the teacher and the learner are fully aware of the interpretation of the relevant uses (from Pāṇini). All these 04 cases are used together in several rules.

(04) NC's Sārasvata aphorisms divided in 13 chapters, are presented in the *Prakriyā* (operational) manner and consequently the titles, thereof, each chapter called a section (पाद) contains a number of rules equally applicable to the topics of other chapters or sections.

(05) The aphorism क्तवत् (13/23) is a suitable example of the famous meta-rule (*Paribhāṣā*) of Patañjali व्याख्यानतो विशेषप्रतिपत्तिर्न हि संदेहादलक्षम् (पं-१), because the aphorisms CK does not read the term निष्ठा in even नुम् of the manuscripts, but the commentators like, AS name the chapter to be निष्ठाधिकारप्रक्रिया.

The meta-rules looking to the nomenclature of the Sārasvata School, it seems that the major meta-rules like, सङ्घी स्थानेयोगा (Pā. 1/1/49), अलोऽन्त्यस्य (Pā. 1/1/52), अनेकाल्लित् सर्वस्य (Pā. 1/1/55), and others are taken for granted in the sense that a teacher knows them. The other meta-rule on the other hand, do not find any purpose here, because NC has not introduced new technical terms but has adopted the terms, like गुण, वृद्धि, उपधा, लोप, अच् (vowel) and others from Pāṇini. For this reason NC uses such technical terms as the traditional or all-accepted ones.

(06) The two major divisions of the technical terms taken in the Pāṇinian school, are adopted by NC, in toto (A) कृत्रिम संज्ञा or artificial terms such as त्ति, and the like which are coined by the author (B) अकृत्रिम संज्ञा traditionally accepted in the grammar and in the language. They can be divided into two categories: (1) known words like वृद्धि, गुण and the like employed in grammar and (2) the abbreviations of longer words.

The above mentioned terms can be understood in another way also वृद्धि, गुण, सन्नियोग, etc. are शब्दसंज्ञा because they denote some specific words as their संज्ञा, while विभाषा, लोप, संप्रसारण and the like are अर्थसंज्ञा for they denote only the sense of or meaning of the words as such.

(07) In the Sārasvata school the technical terms (संज्ञा) are introduced, as and when they are needed. This school introduces a new term लोपश्. The technical term लोपश् is an important contribution of the Sārasvata school of Sanskrit grammar. The significant श् of लोपश् is to prohibit the application of the गुणसन्धि in case of the second allocation of the vowel coalescing (स्वरसन्धि).

In the examples like ते + इह, तय + इह = तइह, Pāṇini employs एचोऽयवायावः (Pā. 6/1/78) changing ते into तय and लोपःशाकल्यस्य (traditionally recited as लोपश्शाकल्यस्य) (Pā. 8/3/19) for dropping य of तय. Here त + इह can not be coalesced on the authority of आद्गुणः (Pā. 6/1/87), because the dropping of य (Pā. 8/3/19) is invalid with reference to आद्गुणः (Pā. 6/1/87) on authority of पूर्वत्रासिद्धम् (Pā. 8/2/1).

NC has not adopted the intricate device of twofold divisions of 07 chapters and 08/01 (सपादसप्ताध्यायी) and 08/02-04 (त्रिपादी) and hence he has taken up the term लोपश् to get rid of the above intricacy of the Pāṇinian School.

It must be borne in mind that regular drop is technically termed as लोप in संयोगान्तस्य लोपः (7/45) (from लोपश्शाकल्यस्य Pā. 8/3/19).¹³

(08) The term अनुबन्ध is derived from अनु + बध् - बध्नाति (9P to tie) meaning “what is attached or tied to.” It is attached to a stem, termination, arrangement or substitute to indicate the occurrence of some special modifications such as विकरण, आगम, गुण or वृद्धि, etc., but which, when the word’s completely formed, is vanished and is cast off, in consonance with the designation इत् given to it.

NC has employed the अनुबन्ध

A (1) indicating its functions as (a) आदिस्वरस्य ञितिवृद्धिः (९/२४) (b) किदिति (2) following its function indicated by Pāṇini. (a) अचो ञिति ॥पा° ७/२/११५॥ (b) किदिति च ॥पा° १/१/५॥

The Sārasvata aphorisms¹⁴ begins with a stanza of salutation followed by two stanzas enumerating the names of 13 sections called पाद. Each of the section contains a certain number of rules or aphorisms.

IV Naming the chapter

The *sūtrapāṭha* concludes the chapters as follows:

- | | |
|--|------------------|
| (१) संज्ञाप्रकरणम् or संज्ञासन्धिः or संज्ञापादः | |
| (२) स्वरसन्धिः | (३) प्रकृतिभावः |
| (४) व्यञ्जनसन्धिः | (५) विसर्गसन्धिः |
| (६) विभक्तिपादः | (७) युष्मदस्मदी |
| (८) कारकम् | (९) तद्धिताः |
| (१०) स्त्रीप्रत्ययाः | (११) समासः |
| (१२) आख्यातः | (१३) कृतः |

V Optional aphorisms

Over and above 568 rules and 90 corrective statements (वार्तिक) of this school, AS has incorporated 91 optional rules which are difficult to be traced out so far.

The editor of *Sārasvata-prakriyā* and *Subodhikā* (P153) incorporates the dubious aphorism असम्भवे पुंसः कक् सौ (*Bhoja-vyākaraṇam* 1/9/66), but the editor does not give numbering.¹⁵

VI The contents of the Sārasvata aphorisms

The salutation runs thus:

“I salute Lord Brahmā, Lord Śiva, Goddess Sarasvatī, Goddess Lakṣmī, Lord Viṣṇu (हरि) and other deities of achievement.” (01)¹⁶

The next two stanzas enumerate the names of the sections.

“(The sections are:) (1) Technical terms, (2-5)

Coalescing, (6) Cases, (7) युष्मद्-अस्मद्, (8) कारक, (9) Secondary derivatives, (10) Governing of Feminine, (11) Compounds, (12) the tenfold Conjugation and (13) Agentive affixes (applied to the roots). पद is an inflected word. Its group is a sentence and that speech is designated to be the wish-fulfilling cow (कामधुक्).”¹⁷

As it is already mentioned earlier the Sārasvata school consists of 568 rules in the form of aphorisms called सूत्र. They are divided into 13 topics or sections called पाद.

VII An aphorism, its definition and illustration

An aphorism (सूत्र) is defined in two ways: (1) general definition and (2) special scientific definition.

The general definition is

अल्पाक्षरमसन्दिग्धं सारवद्विश्वतोमुखम् ।
अस्तोभमनवद्यं च सूत्रं सूत्रविदो विदुः ॥

The aphorism अवर्जा नामिनः (1/5) can be taken as illustration in which there are only six syllables of unavoidable presences. It is a non-dubious (असन्दिग्ध) with the meaning (सार) of the vowels except अ are termed as नामिन्, which is applicable विश्वतोमुख to all the vowels except the अ. It is non obstructed (अस्तोभ) in any area of application and at the same time it is perfectly clear (अनवद्य) in giving its own meaning.

Though very few aphorisms are quite large, the major part of the aphorisms is so less syllable (अल्पाक्षर) that the meaning is arrived at through the help of the explanation (व्याख्यानतो विशेषप्रतिपत्तिः).

The special scientific (शास्त्रीय) definition of an aphorism of grammar is as follows:

संज्ञा च परिभाषा च विधिर्नियम एव च ।
अधिकारोऽपवादश्च षड्विधं सूत्रलक्षणम् ॥

(1) The aphorism presenting the technical term is अइउऋलृ समानाः (1/1) stating the vowels अ, इ, उ, ऋ and लृ are termed as समान.

(2) The metarules (परिभाषा) are not incorporated in the Sārasvata aphorisms, because it has the topic wise arrangement (like that of the *Kaumudī* texts) and also the most necessary metarules are borrowed from the Pāṇinian school with slight changes.

(3) A विधिसूत्र enjoins a rule like विसर्जनीयस्य सः (5/1) which gives the rule of changing the विसर्ग (:) in to स्, while (4) a नियमसूत्र regulates such a change as in कुप्वोः ऋक् ऋपौ वा (5/2) regulating the change of विसर्ग in to ऋक् and ऋप् optionally (i.e. statesco also) when the विसर्ग is followed by क् (also ख्) and प् (also फ्).

(5) An अधिकारसूत्र gives or marks the limit of the function of any rule (also a word or words of the rule). This device is not employed by NC, because the arrangement in his text is topic wise.

(6) An अपवादसूत्र means a rule of exception or an exceptional rule, which is also not found necessary, and hence NC has not employed any exceptional rule in his system.

This shows that the intricacies of the rules of अधिकार

and अपवाद are avoided so as to make the system easy, simple and consuming less time in learning.

Section 01 is titled Technical Terms and it deals with 06 aphorisms declaring 05 technical terms like समान (1), ह्रस्व, दीर्घ & प्लुत as well as सवर्ण (2), सन्ध्यक्षर (3) स्वर (4) and नामिन् (5) while the last provides the rule to frame the abbreviated forms called प्रत्याहार (6).

Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya's (=AS) explanation is short and perfect. The same style is accepted by Rāmāśrama (=RM), Candrakīrti (=CK) on the other hand elaborates the aphorism furnishing the etymology and grammatical forms of the technical term of समान. While Jinacandra's (=JC) explanation is brief.

AS is exact in furnishing the well-known (Pāṇinian) technical terms like प्रत्याहार and justifies the Non-coalescing (अ सन्धि) of the vowels in the aphorism, to which RM adopts the same explanation.

CK pointing out the number of words of the aphorism introduces the aphorism and then explains it fully commenting on अ इ उ ऋ and लृ समान (1/1). He also reveals the technique employed by the सूत्रकार.

AS incorporating the last aphorism justifies लोकतः as from other texts of Sanskrit grammar, (probably) that of Pāṇini who speaks of the *mātras* in his *Śikṣā*.

RM replacing सजातीय (homogeneous) for सवर्ण: makes his explanation short, while JC introducing the सवर्णसंज्ञा illustrates the three varieties of अ as अ आ आ ३ and instructs to understand the rest in the preceding manner.

CK on the other hand gives the etymology of ह्रस्व (short) as that which is less in comparison of दीर्घ (long), the दीर्घ as that which makes the mouth widely open when pronounced and प्लुत (prolated) as a vowel (short or long) which is lengthened mere i.e. prolated. He revising the technique of the सूत्रकार furnishes the meaning of सवर्ण as the similar and also refers the three fold varieties of the latter.

AS enumerates nine (five समान + four सन्ध्यक्षर) vowels and paraphrases उभये (both) with the same CK explaining the words of AS introduces his predecessor with the word “some” (केचित्) and refer (to prove false) his explanation. Both RM and JC combine the aphorisms 3 and 4, but AS and CK specify ‘five’ (पञ्च) as समान and ‘four’ (चत्वारः) as एकार etc.

CK as usual commenting on the explanation of AS, furnishes grammatical explanation of अवर्णवर्जीः as well as अनुक्रान्ताः and etymological explanation of नामिन् as well as स्वरः.

AS and also JC divide the aphorism into two seem to read two aphorisms, but the Ms. of *Sārasvata-sūtrapāṭha* reads both the aphorism as one. CK specifically points out the division of the aphorism into two.¹⁸

CK explaining the method of abbreviating the प्रत्याहार gives grammatical explanation of संख्या + नियमो न as संख्या + अनियमो नास्ति and enumerates 20 प्रत्याहार quoting two verses.

हसो झबो जबश्चैव यपो अब इलश्चपः ।

अमो झभः खसः प्रोक्तो झसश्च छत ईरितः ॥

यमो हबः खपश्चोक्तो डबश्च ढभ इष्यते ।

रसो वसः शसः ख्यातो झपो अव उदाहृतः ॥

CK here makes a new aphorism: हसा व्यञ्जनानि and explains it, but the terminological explanations can never be an aphorism.

Section 02 is titled Vowel-coalescing (स्वरसन्धि) deals with 19 aphorisms declaring 03 यणादि coalescing इ यम् (7-10), followed by 04 aphorisms of गुणसन्धि (11-14), the term लोपश्, (15), 02 aphorisms of पूर्वरूप (16-17), 06 aphorisms of दीर्घसन्धि (18-23) and at the end he gives 02 aphorisms of वृद्धिसन्धि (24-25).

CK also justifies the words of the aphorism and of the *Sārasvataprakriyā* with the terminology and the aphorisms of Pāṇinian grammar.

CK remarks that the तपरकरण is to suggest the limitation (तावन्मात्र).

CK excepting confusion between two aphorisms डस्स्य (6/21) and डस्य (2/11) refers to the optional reason of the latter (डस्य 6/21) डसिडसोरस्य.

CK commenting on सवर्णे दीर्घः सह (2/12) furnishes the previous कारिका of दीर्घसन्धि.

Section 03 is titled as Non-coalescing (प्रकृतिभाव) and it contains 04 aphorisms prohibiting the vowel-coalescing in cases of अमी (these) (26), of dual form ending in इ, उ & ए (27), of the indeclinable ending in ओ (28) and of the prolated vowels (29).

The term प्रकृतिभाव (non-coalescing) (also the name of a chapter here) is the same as प्रगृह्य of Pāṇini (1/1/11) is defined as all dual case affixes ending in इ, उ or ए.

CK explains the grammatical meaning of प्रकृतिभाव as well as प्रगृह्य and presents the difference between the two forms of the word अमी (these or those) अमी (sick or disease).

CK reads दूराह्वाने टेः प्लुतः as a separate aphorism, but the *sūtrapāṭha* excludes it in the set of four aphorisms of Non-coalescing (प्रकृतिभाव).

Section 04 is titled Consonant-coalescing (व्यञ्जनसन्धि) contains 17 aphorisms. He gives the rules of the coalescing of consonants of चप form (30-33), of स् & त-class with श् & च-class its prohibition (34-38), of त् with ल (39), सक् augment to छ् and त् (40), चक् augment to श् (41), reduplication of the nasals इ, ण्, न् as well as ह (42-43) and the nasalising of म् and न् (44-46).

CK mentions the gender and the number of each of the words of the aphorism and also the relative aphorisms useful in their derivation.

CK accepting छन्दसि as a separate aphorism (though not in even AS) explains with the illustration and concludes the chapter on सन्धि with the remark: इति चतुर्थसन्ध्यनुसारेण व्यञ्जनसन्धेरवचूरिलेशतो लिखिता ॥

Section 05 is titled विसर्ग-coalescing (विसर्गसन्धि) consists of 10 aphorisms enjoining the rules of substitution the sibilant स in place of विसर्ग followed by the optional substitution of श, ष and स (47), the half of विसर्ग, when followed by क and प (including ख and फ) (48), the change of विसर्ग into उ (49-50), the drop of विसर्ग which is technically termed as लोपश् (51-52), र in place of विसर्ग, including the lengthening of the preceding vowel (when the र is dropped)

(53-55) and the last aphorism is a type of an exceptional rule the vowel-coalescing (गुण or वृद्धि), even when the विसर्ग of सः & एसः is dropped (56).

CK explaining the optional aphorism अहो रोडरानिषु justifies the duplication of प in अहर्षति with the help of the optional aphorism राद्यपो द्विः.

CK gives the aphorism twice भोसः (5/6), but it is not clear whether the aphorism is भोस् भगोस् अघोस्, because (i) here he explains भोसः as a प्रत्याहार of class words (जातीय) and (ii) under the aphorism लिङ्गार्थे प्रथमा he affirms the aphorism as भोस् भगोस् अघोस्, which is not found in any one of the five mss.

Section 06 is titled Nominal declensions or Case-relations (विभक्तिपाद) consists of 101 aphorisms.

He introduces the technical term नाम for any word including agentive nouns, secondary derivatives (तद्धित) as well as compounds (57), followed the case suffixes to be added on to a word with special changes (58-62), declensions of the number nouns (63) which declined equally in all the three genders (64), of the pronoun त्रि (three) (65), षष्-षड् (six) (66-67), the pronoun कति (how-many) (68), followed by अष्टन् (eight) (69-70), the word रै (wealth) (71), the case suffixes to be added on to a word (72-79) and pronouns and the pronominal declensions (80-84).

Then follow the rules of the pronoun (85) and विसर्ग is dropped when followed by the consonant (86). He deals all the forms of the Masculine words ending in आ (87-92). He gives the rules of all the forms of the words ending in short इ and long ई in two aphorisms (93-97), followed by

the rules of the words ending in इ and उ (98-108), ऋ (109), पुंस् (a man) (110) and the rules of the words with an indicatory उ or ऋ like शतृ (अत्) (Present Participle) and अप् (111-113).

He then gives the rules of declensions the words ending in न्, स्, अप् (water) and महत् (great) (114), followed by the lengthening of the penultimate of न् (115-117), नाम् (Genitive plural) (118), of the words ending in इन् preceded by सि (Nominative sing.) (119). Then follow the rules of dropping of the penultimate अ (120-121) and the lengthening of the word अञ्च (123). Then he gives the rules of the change न् to ण् (124-125), स् to ष् (126-127), the dropping (लुक्) of सि (Nomi. sing.) and अम् (Acc. sing.) of the Neuter words (128), followed by the rules of declensions of the Neuter words ending in अ (129), of the pronouns अन्य, etc. in Neuter (130), followed by rest of declensions of Neuter words ending in अ (131-133), ending in इ (134), of the words like अस्थि, etc. (135), of the उक्तपुंस्क words (136), the change of व of वस्, etc. to उ (137), and of श्वन् (a dog), etc. (138). Then begins the rules of dropping (लोपः) (139-143), followed by changing व of दिव् (sky) into औ as well as ऊ (144-145). Which is followed by the rules of चतुः (four) (146), अनडुह (a bull) (147-148), of the words ending in ओ (149-150). Followed by the rules of declensions of the word सखि (a friend) (151-152), of the words like उशनस्, etc. (153), of the roots ending in ई and ऊ and स्त्री as well as भू (154-157).

CK supplies the optional aphorism along with the original अनडुहश्च (6/91) and also explains here सावनडुहः (interpolated aphorism).

AS gives the optional aphorism लुकि न तन्निमित्तम्, which is explained by CK taking the help of the परिभाषा-कृताकृतप्रसङ्गी नित्यम् (प°४३), etc.

CK's remark regarding the succession (अनुवृत्ति) of a from the aphorism वा सु (6/14) makes clear that most of the scribes (of mss.) have wrongly read the aphorism as अद्धि instated of आद्धि.

CK designates the indicator उ (in असुङ्) to be for the shake of the pronunciation, but he further supports AS's remark that the indicator उ stands to provide the scope of न् (नुम्).

CK furnishes exact areas of the unknown terms that are the indicator उ indicates the suffixes like वतु and the indicator ऋ indicates the suffixes like शतृ.

The explanation of this aphorism given by CK with its words analyzed and forms recognised shows that this is the proper place of the aphorism and not in the chapter on स्त्रीप्रत्यय.

CK seems to accept तादौ instated of शसादौ in the aphorism, because he comments primarily तादौ and secondarily शसादौ introducing it as another view.

CK adds सौ at the end of the aphorism and recognizes its form, but there is a clear succession of it from the preceding aphorism आ सौ (6/87).

CK gives the another explanation of the aphorism comprising of their words and justifies the compound word दिवि उषितः द्यूषितः.

Section 07 is titled युष्मदस्मदी consists of 75 aphorisms.

He presents the special substitutes or doublet forms of युष्मद् (You) and अस्मद् (I, We) like ते-मे, वाम्-नौ and वस्-नस् along with their regulations (158-161) and followed by

the forms of the pronouns युष्मद् (You) and अस्मद् (I, We) following the sequence of singular, dual and plural (162-173). Then follow the rule of the words सखि (a friend) and the word पति (a husband) (174-175), the substitutes of the number noun त्रि (three) and चतुः (four) in Feminine (176), of the Feminine words ending in काप् (आ) (177-179), followed by गो (a cow) (180-181). Then follow the rules of the pronouns like त्वत् (182), किम् (what, who) (183), अदस् (that) (184-185, 192-195), तद् (that) (186), इदम् (this) (187-191), the change of प् of अप् (water) to द् (196-197), the substitution of क-class (कु) for च-class (चु) (198-199) and of ष् for ड् (200), followed by dropping (लोपश्) of न् of the words (201), of the last of the conjuncts (202) and of स् initial as well as क् (203).

Then he gives the rules of various changes of विसर्गः (204-205), incase of अहन् (a day) (206-207), दोष् (208-210), the change of ह् to द् (211), द् and ह् of the roots (beginning with द्) to घ (212-213) and ह् to ध् (214), followed by the change of छ्, श्, ष् and ज् (of राज्-राजते, etc.) to ष् (215), ष् and द् to क् (216), स् of verbal termination to त् (217-218) and द् to स् (219), followed by the substitution of चप group for खस group (220), जब group for झब group (221-222), initial जब group for झब group (223) and ध् for त् & थ् (224).

Then he gives the rules of dropping (लुक्) of the case terminations in case of indeclinables (अव्यय) (225), of compounds (226) where in some cases there will be no dropping (अलुक्) (227) and continues with the dropping of the case termination in the अव्ययीभाव compound (228), the dropping of अ of अम् (Acc. sing.) (229) as well as in the singulars of टा (Instr.) and ङि (Loc.) (230). Then follow the regulations of अव्ययीभाव compound being always in Neuter and the singular usage of the compounds द्विगु and द्वन्द्व (231-232).

CK specifically enumerates च and others (चादि) of the aphorism च (and), वा (or), ह (alas, surprise), आह (alas, surprise) and एव (indeed).

AS comments upon this aphorism having the substitutes तिसृ and चतसृ to be decline like those ending in ऋ which seems like justifying the mistaken aphorism with वत् at the end, because only तिस्र चतस्र words would have served with the purpose the help of Panini (7/2/99).

CK also reads the aphorism न तिसृचतसृ नामि दीर्घः and recognizes the forms.

AS's style of giving the words of the aphorism भि दपाम् ॥७/३९॥ - भि द् अपाम् separately.

CK discards the argument and justifies the aphorism षो ङः (7/43).

CK refers to the addition of रः in the aphorism, though he seems aware of the succession of अ it from the preceding aphorism अहो रोङ्गान्निषु (7/50).

AS (or the editor) omits this aphorism and supplies the optional aphorism द्रुहादीनां घत्वढत्वे वा.

AS does not, but CK specifically notes the succession of the word or words of the *sūtra pāṭhakrama* and adds that he will no more mention the situation here after.

NC present here the अलुक् तत्पुरुष compound (7/70) under the regulation of dropping (लुक्) the case affixes

of the Indeclinable, Compounds including the अव्ययीभावात् (7/71). Which are commented up on by all the commentators in the Chapter of Compounds.

CK points out the aphorism संख्यापूर्वो द्विगुः (Pā. 2/1/52) as an important aphorism, though not in the *Sarasvatasutrapathah* mentioned with the name क्रम.

Section 08 is titled कारकम् consists of 07 aphorisms. He gives the rules on the case relation of a word governing Nominative (including Vocative) (233-234), followed by the case relations governing Accusative to Locative in a single¹⁹ aphorism (235), prepositions like विना (without), सह (with) governing various cases (236), the agent and object (कार्ये = कर्मणि) Genitive (237), the Ablative for the point of origin (238) and the Nominative when the object, instrument etc. are not expressed (अन्योक्त) (239).

The term कर्म (of Pā. 1/4/49) (the object of an action) is not defined in the Sārasvata School. It is one of the six कारक and takes the Accusative case.

The term कारक (9/8) (Instrument of action) has not been defined by NC, as it is traditionally accepted. It is explained as the capacity in which a thing becomes Instrumental in bringing out an action. This capacity is looked upon in the following कारिका -

कर्ता कर्म च करणं संप्रदानं तथैव च ।
अपादानाधिकरणे इत्येवं कारकाणि षट् ॥

CK gives grammatical explanation of the term लिङ्ग as (1) that by which the nouns are recognized as Masculine, Feminine and Neuter and (2) as the nouns only.

CK seems to include here below, the aphorisms: (1) आमन्त्रणे सिद्धिः (8/2) and (2) भोस् भगोस् अघोस्.

CK reads the aphorism आमन्त्रणे सिद्धिः (8/2) under लिङार्थे प्रथमा (8/1) which is supported by the Poona Ms. of the *sūtrapāṭha*.

AS incorporates all most all the *Kāraṇa* aphorisms of Pāṇini either in toto or with a little alteration.

Section 09 is titled Secondary derivatives (तद्धिताः) consists of 35 aphorisms. He gives various terminations in different sense. NC incorporates the terminations like अण् (making वृद्धि) in the sense of a son (अपत्य) (240-241), इञ् (इ) (making वृद्धि) (242), ण्य (य making वृद्धि), आयनण् (आयन making वृद्धि), एयण् (एय making वृद्धि) and णीय (इय making वृद्धि) to the words like गर्ग, etc. and the optional dropping of these terminations (243-244), the same affixes are applicable to the names of deities optionally (245-246) and also applicable to a कारक expressing the action (247). Then he gives the terminations like क, इन, इय and इक् along with their usage in the same sense (248-249), वत् in the sense of equal (250), त्, त्व and यण् (य making वृद्धि) in the abstract noun (251), मत् and वत् in the sense possession (252-253), तर – तम and ईयस् – इष्ठ expressing comparison and superiority (प्रकर्ष) (254), the regulations regarding the dropping of य of अयादिसन्धि (255-257), the dropping of the टि part (258) and of the final न् (259) followed by the technical terms टि, उपधा and इत् (260-262) as well as the regulations for the वृद्धि (263-267), followed by the augment युक् (य) (268), and the substitutes घत् and घ्न of हन् – हन्ति (269-70), followed by the augment पुक् (प्) (271), as well as shortening of the roots with an indicatory स् (मिताम्) (272) and at the end the technical terms वृद्धि (273) and गुण (274).

CK commenting on the term अपत्ये explains it as one because of whom, the father (or the fatherhood) is not lost or deviated. He also admits the meaning in the wider sense of sons and grandsons (पुत्र-पौत्रादि) as well as disciples and grand disciples (शिष्य-प्रशिष्यादि).²⁰

AS commenting on the aphorism मान्तोपधाद्वत्विनौ (9/14) explains many of the *uṇādi* aphorisms. CK elaborates them.²¹

AS commenting on the aphorism presents many of the aphorisms of Pāṇini, sometimes the same aphorisms, but mostly by making short.

AS and CK seem to justify the तपरकरण in the aphorism अरेदो नामिनो गुणः (अर् एत् ओ) (9/35) in different way. AS in his explanation drops त् of एत्, while CK adds त् to even ओ as ओत्.

Section 10 is titled Feminine affixes (स्त्रीप्रत्ययाः) consists of 11 aphorisms.

He gives the rules regarding the terminations enjoined for Feminine words like आप् (आ) to the Masculine words ending in अ (275), ईप् (ई) to the words ending in न्, ऋ and अण् (अ) (276) and to the roots with indicatories ष्, ट्, उ and ऋ (277) as well as to नद्, etc. (278), to the class noun (279) parts of the body and in connection with a man (280). The termination ऐ to the words like मनु (281-282) followed by निपात like पत्नि (283) and at the end the substitutes of व् or ऊ for उ (284-285).

AS, CK, RM and JC have no comments on the structure of the aphorisms of this Section. All of them provide illustrations of each of the rules.

Section 11 is titled Compound (समासः) consists of 20 aphorisms.

He gives the definition of the terms like compound (समास) (286), द्विगुः (287), अव्ययीभाव (288), तत्पुरुष (289), नञ्-तत्पुरुष (290), द्वन्द्व (291), बहुव्रीहिः (292) and कर्मधारय (293), followed by the suffixes ट, अ, ड and क (294), the regulations regarding the first member (295-298), followed by the definition of उपसर्ग (299) and its rules of application (300-301), the definition of (निपात) (302), followed by its substitutes like तत्र (303) as well as सद्यः, etc. (304) and there technical term an indeclinable (अव्यय) (305).

The term compound (समास) is explained as the case inflected word compounded with a case inflected word with which it is connected in sense. NC has mentioned 06 principal kinds of the compound.

The compound अव्ययीभाव (11/3) (Indeclinable compound) is explained as that an indeclinable (अव्यय) is compounded with sense of an inflective affix (विभक्ति) etc, and the compound so formed is termed अव्ययीभाव. It is a self explanatory term. In the अव्ययीभाव compound, the sense of the first of its members (which is an indeclinable) is main one.

The तत्पुरुष (11/4) (a compound in which the last member is qualified by the first one without losing its grammatical independence) is not defined by NC. NC in the major divisions of the तत्पुरुष compound are (1) संख्या-तत्पुरुष or द्विगु (11/2), (2) विभक्ति-तत्पुरुष (11/4), (3) नञ्-तत्पुरुष (11/5) and (4) समानाधिकरण – तत्पुरुष as the कर्मधारय (11/8). However these divisions are not mentioned by NC, the commentators divide them clearly as noted above.

The term बहुव्रीहि (11/7) is explained as a compound in which component members designate something else (अन्यार्थे). The term बहुव्रीहि is neither defined by Pāṇini nor NC.

The compound कर्मधारय (11/8) (the Appositional determinative Compound) is defined as a तत्पुरुष compound, of which a case of each member is the same (तुल्यार्थे). The कर्मधारय compound is a variety of the तत्पुरुष compound.

CK very clearly mentions the fields of the term “in a compound” (समासे) that (1) ट in बहुव्रीहिः, (2) अ in तत्पुरुषः, (3) ड in द्वन्द्वः and (4) क in कर्मधाराय, though the कारिका²² (taken as interpolation) gives the order as (1) तत्पुरुष, (2) द्वन्द्व, (3) बहुव्रीहिः and (4) कर्मधारय.

CK explaining reasons of making compounds, comments on compounds for the purpose of one accent (ऐकस्वर्य) means (1) an easy effort in pronunciation and (2) the vedic accentuation.

CK giving substitutes of the aphorism सहादेः सादिः (11/13) enlists the group of words enjoining the substitute स.

CK gives the etymological explanation of the term निपात (indeclinable) as that which occurs in various senses and furnishes the meaning of the entire group of 65 including 15 vowels.

Section 12 is titled Verbal formations (आख्यातः) consists of 174 aphorisms.

He declares that the terminations given here below

are applied to the roots (धातु) (306), then follow the verbal terminations separately for each of the Present Tense (वर्तमान) (307), the Potential (विधि) and Optative moods (सम्भावन) (308), the wish (आशीः) and Imperative moods (प्रेरणम्) (309), the Imperfect Past Tense (अनद्यतन) (310), the Perfect Past Tense (परोक्ष) (311), the Benedictive (आशीः) Mood (312) and the First Future Tense (श्वस्तन)²³ (313).

The termination यक् (य) to be applied to forms of Impersonal and Passive (314), the application of the conjugational sign अप् (अ) in the Active sense (कर्तरि) (and to the roots of the first conjugation – भ्वादि) (315), followed by the conjugational signs लुक् (dropping अ of अप्) in the Second conjugation (अदादि) (316), reduplication (द्विः) in the Third conjugation (ह्लादि) (317), य in the Fourth conjugation (दिवादि) (318), नु in the Fifth conjugation (स्वादि) (319), अ in the Sixth conjugation²⁴ (तुदादि) (320), नम् (न) in the Seventh conjugation (रुधादि) (321), उप् (उ) in the Eight conjugation (तनादि) (322) and ना in the Ninth conjugation (ब्रयादि) (323).

Pāṇini's *Aṣṭādhyāyī* reads the following order : अदादि (2/4/72), ह्लादि (3/1/73), तुदादि (2/1/77), रुधादि (3/1/78), तनादि (3/1/79) and ब्रयादि (3/1/81).

The NC begins with the substitutes आन for हि in the Ninth conjugation (324), followed by the augment स्यप् (स्य) in the Second future (भविष्यत्) (325), the augment अट् (अ) of the Imperfect, etc. (326), along with the augment आट् (आ)²⁵ to the root beginning with a vowel (327), followed by the augment स्यप् (स्य) in the Conditional mood (328), the rules and regulation regarding the suffix सि (स) and its substitutes like सक् (स्), etc. of the Aorist (329-338), followed by various augments of the Imperfect Past like ईट् (ई) to अस् – अस्ति (339) and अट् (अ) to रुद् – रोदिति (340), the dropping (लोप) of the

Imperfect Past terminations स् and त् (341-345), of अट् (अ) (346), of हि (Imperative 2nd Person sing.) (347-348) and of अ before अन्ति (349), followed by the change of the conjugational sign अ to आ (before the terminations beginning with व and म) (350), the change of आ of आये, etc. and of या (Potential) to ई (351-352) and the augment इट् (इ) to युस् (Potential 3rd Person plural) (353).

Then follow the regulations regarding the non-अप् (= कित्) terminations such as, the substitute ईयम् for याम् (Potential 1st Person sing.) (354), the optional dropping (लोप) of the vowel उ (of the 5th and 8th conjugations) before the terminations beginning with व and म (355-356), the change of अ (of कृ – करोति) to उ (357), the change of ना (9th conjugation) to न् before अन्ति (358) and नी before terminations beginning with a consonants (359), the dropping or the change of आ of the roots to ई (360), the dropping of अ of नम् (न) (7th conjugation) and of अस् – अस्ति (361-362), the change of अन्त (3rd Person pl.) to अत in the Imperfect and when preceded by duplicated forms (363-364) as well as अन् Imperfect (3rd Person pl.) to उस् (365-366), णप् (अ making वृद्धि) (Perfect Past) to डौ (औ) (367) and the substitute धि for हि (Imperative) (368).

Then follow the areas of परस्मैपद (369) and आत्मनेपद (370) followed by 03 Persons (371) and the applications of आत्मनेपद (372) and Active voice (373) as well as Passive voice (374), followed by the regulating आत्मनेपद in the cases of the roots like विश्-विशति prefixed with निं and so on²⁶ (375-376), the regulations of उभयपद (377), आत्मनेपद (378) and कित् as well as सेट्, वेट् and अनिट् (379-384), followed by Desiderative (385-386) and the suffix आय to गुप्-गोपायति, etc. (387), Denominative formation (388-391), Causal (392) and the 10th conjugation (393), the technical term धातु (394-395) and the rules

regarding the lengthening (दीर्घ) (396-403), the rules of reduplication (404-407) and the substitution of च class for क class and ह (408), of जघ्न group and चघ्न for झघ्न group (409) and of अ for ऋ (410), the rules regarding shortening (ह्रस्व) (411-413) गुण (414-416), the augments नुक् (न) (417), रीक् (ई) (418) and the regulations of shortening and the lengthening (419-423), followed by the dropping of अ of the roots (424), the change of अ of the roots to इ (425-426), the acceptations जहि, एधि and शाधि (427), the गुण rules (428-435), along with its prohibition (436), the regulations of the dropping (लोप) (437-443), followed by the substitutes roots अस्-अस्ति, etc. for भू-भवति, etc. (444), आ for diphthongs (सन्ध्यक्षर) (445) स् and न् for ष् and ण् of the roots initials (446) and the optional forms of विद्-वेत्ति (447) and ब्रू-ब्रवीति in the Present Tense (448-450).

Then he given the substitutes of the cases terminations like duals (451), छ् for गम्-गच्छति, etc. (452) पश्, etc. for दृश्, etc. (453), short for long vowels in पू-पुनाति (454) and जा for जन्-जायते and ज्ञा-जानाति (455), the infix मुम् (म्) to मुच्-मुञ्चति, etc. (456-457) and नुम् (न्) to the roots with an indicatory इ (458), the lengthening of शम्-शाम्यति (459) and of the roots with an indicatory letter of जघ्न group (460), the rules of the roots with an indicatory अनुदात्त (461), followed by the change of the vowel ऋ of the roots to इर् (462) and ऋ to उर् (463), followed by the augment इट् (इ) (464-467) and वेट् (optional इट्) (468-469) and अनिट् (470-475), followed by the Periphrastic Past (आम्युक्त) (476), the augment वुक् (व्) to भू-भवति (Perfect Past) (477), ईट् (ई) to ग्रह्-गृह्णाति (Imperfect Past) (478) and at the end the change of घ् (of ध्वे, etc.) to ढ् (479).

AS remarks the prohibition of गुण in यक् चतुर्षु (12/9) on the strength of the indicatory क्, to which CK supports.

CK commenting on the aphorism ह्रस्वान्तात् सक् (12/27)

justifies that the twofold intention of the *Sūtrakāra* (1) it prohibits गुणकार्य and (2) it regulates its place.

CK remarks that the aphorism दादेः (12/40) is formed of one word.

All the editions and the manuscripts read the aphorism with ई i.e. या ई (12/47), but ई occurs by way of succession (अनुवृत्ति) just from the preceding aphorism आदाथ ईः (12/46).

This aphorism याम ईयम् (12/49) is found differently i.e. यामियम् (B), याम इयम् (B2, P), यामियम् (AS and CK) etc. but looking to the application one has to concord all the versions with the result i.e. याम इयम् (12/49).

AS remarks that elision and the vowel ई occurs in the aphorism ई हसे (12/55) by way of succession.

CK however, points out the presiding aphorisms whence the words get the succession.

NC gives only one aphorism निविशादेः (12/70) in comparison to Pāṇini who gives 67 aphorisms regulating the आत्मनेपद.

CK gives separate words of the aphorism नाम्नो य ई चास्य (12/83).

The aphorism द्विश्च (12/99) as an aphorism, which is commented like an aphorism by CK, but the *Sūtrakāra* does not include it because the next aphorism स्वरादेः परः (12/100) gives the same rule.

CK does not read the aphorism नानिटि से (12/128) with clear and usual remark: this is an aphorism (सूत्र), though he gives separate words.²⁷

CK comments the aphorism गुहे: (neither in the *sūtrapāṭha* nor in the *Sārasvataprakriyā*) gives the वृत्ति only. If the aphorism is included, it may get the order 12/131 (looking to the sequence).

AS includes the aphorism ब्रूवो वचि: (Pā. 2/4/53) without mentioning its source, CK also without giving its source comments upon it as an aphorism of the Sārasvata school.

CK commenting on the aphorism मुचादेर्मुम् (12/151) enumerates the group of मुच् and other roots, but does not find it necessary to mention or to give the forms of विद्ल् (265).

CK supplies the aphorism रुदादेश्चतुर्णां ह्रसादे: (12/160) governing सम्प्रसारणम् against the cursory statement of AS (who writes only सम्प्रसारणम्).

AS quotes the aphorism ह्रम्यन्तक्षणस्वसजागृणिश्व्येदिताम् (Pā. 7/2/5) to conjugate the Aorist form of the root श्वस्-श्वसिति.

CK explains the statement जक्षादे: etc. as a separate aphorism, but the *Sūtrapāṭha* does not give it.

CK recognizes the forms of the words the aphorism उदितः क्त्वा (12/164).

AS explains the confusing word वु: of the aphorism

वुस्से (12/166) as the Ablative sing. of combination of उ + ऋ, which is again clarified by CK stating that this compound is explained (by AS) for the understanding of the beginners (बाल).

CK commenting on the aphorism कासादिप्रत्ययादाम् क्रस्भूपरः (12/171) refers to *Candrikā* with the remark that the explanation is easy, yet *Candrikā* has explained the aphorism.²⁸

Section 13 is titled Agentive affixes (कृतः) consists of 89 aphorisms. The Agentive suffixes like तृ, वुण् (= अक, making वृद्धि) (480-481), क (अ, making neither गुण nor वृद्धि) (482), अ, णिन् (इन्, making वृद्धि) (483), श to दृश-पश्यति and other roots (484), ण (अ, making वृद्धि) to ज्वल्-ज्वलति, etc. (485), ण (अ, making वृद्धि) to the roots having an object (कार्यम् = कर्म) (486), ड (अ) replacing the vowel अ of the roots (487-488), अ as well as ट (अ) (489), इ, ख (अ), खि (इ) (both enjoying मुम्) (490), खश् (अ) to the roots एज्-एजते, etc. (491), ख्युट् (उ = अक) (492), विण् being zero termination to the root भज्-भजते, etc. (493), मनिप् (मन्), कनिप् (वन्, making neither गुण nor वृद्धि), वनिप् (वन्) to the roots ending in आ (494), क्तिप् (a zero termination) (495), टक् (अ), सक् (अ) to दृश्-पश्यति, to the standard to comparison (उपमान) (496), आ to the pronouns like सर्व, etc. (497), the substitutes की for किम् and ईश् (ई) for इदम् (498), the substitute अम् for अदस् (499) and णिनि (इन्, making वृद्धि), क्तिप् (zero termination), वनिप् (वन्) and in the sense of Past Tense (500-501).

Next he takes up special rules of क्त (त) termination of the Past Passive Participle as well as क्तवत् (तवत्) termination of the Past Active Participle (502), क्सु (वस्) and कान (आन) in the sense of Past Perfect Tense (503), शतृ (अत्) and शान (आन) in the sense of Present Tense (504), वसु (वस्) applied optionally to the root विद्-वेत्ति in the sense of Present Tense

(505), followed by the augment मुक् (म) to the termination आन of आत्मनेपद (506), the termination तृन् (तृ) applied in the sense of “Character, behavior” (शील) (507), the suffixes इष्णु, स्तु and क्तु (नु) (508), षाक् (आक्), उ and उक् (उक्) (509), ऊक् applied in the sense of Frequentative (यङ्) (510), followed by the dropping of (making necessary changes in) the formations (511), कि (इ) to the roots ending in आ and ऋ enjoining reduplication in the sense of Past (512), तक् (त) to the roots with an indicatory जि (उभयपद) in the sense of Present Tense (513), followed by the agentive suffixes उण् and others (514), the general suffix तुम् in the sense of Future Tense (भविष्यत्) (515), the suffix घञ् and its regulation (516-518), the suffix अ to the roots beginning with a vowel (519-520), the suffix अयुस् to the roots with an indicatory तु (521), the suffix त्रिम् (त्रिम) to the roots with an indicatory डु (522), the suffixes नङ् (न), कि (इ) (523), the explanation of क्त (त) governing Neuter in the forms of intransitive roots (524&527), the suffix युट् (= अन) in the sense of an instrument (साधन) and a substratum (आधार) (525-526), extending regulation about the employment of the Potential suffixes in the sense of fitness or propriety (528), the suffixes खल् (अ) (enjoying the infix म) and यु (= अन) in the sense of “difficult” (कृच्छ्र) and “easy” (अकृच्छ्र) (529), the optional suffix य to the roots ending in a vowel and to those ending in a consonant of प-class as well as to the group of शक्-शक्नोति and other roots (530-532), the suffix घ्यण् (य, making वृद्धि) to the roots ending in ऋ or with a consonant (533-534&543), the suffix क्यप् (य) to the roots having a penultimate ऋ (535), the suffix क्ति (ति) forming the Abstract noun in Feminine (536), the suffix अङ् (अ, making neither गुण nor वृद्धि) to the roots with an indicatory ष् and so on (537-539).

The change of final च् and ज् into क् and ग् (540), the augment तुक् (त) applied to the base ending in a short vowel (541), a root with conjugational sign (in the pronouns of 1st, 4th, 6th and 10th conjugations) (542), the substitute औ in place of अ of सह-सहते and वह-वहते in the First Future Tense (544-546), यु and वु to be replaced by अन and अक (547), the change of र of the roots into अ in the Perfect Past Tense (548), the process of changing a semi vowel of the roots into a simple vowel (सम्प्रसारण) in the Perfect Past, etc. (549 & 551), the roots ग्रह्-गृहाति, etc. into the simple vowel (सम्प्रसारण) (550).

The change of the consonant द् of the roots into त् (552-553), इ as well as इ to स्था-तिष्ठति and other roots (554), the change of क्त (त) into न (555-556 & 558), the exceptional forms (निपातन) त्राण (protected) and others (557), the suffix क्त्व (त्व) and its regulation about replacing त्य or य (क्यप्) (depending on the prefix) (559-561), the rule of Frequentative suffix णम् (अ) in the sense of repetition (अभिकांक्षायाम्) (562).

The function of a prolated vowel in case of calling (आह्वाने) from a far (दूरात्) (563), the derivation of the word Laksmi (565).

The general suffix कार to any letter and the optional suffix इफ् to be applied to the letter र to make रेफ for रकार (566-567).

The last aphorism लोकाच्छेषस्य सिद्धिः (13/89) of the Sārasvata school of Sanskrit grammar (already referred to under Section 02) declares itself as an aid text or system to the system (लोक) of another which naturally means that of Pāṇini, though not directly. It offers an humble suggestion

to refer to other school of Sanskrit grammar to learn the usages like मातः + आदेः = मातरादेः (and not मात आदेः), in order to learn the reason why the विसर्ग is not dropped (568).

AS incorporates many aphorisms of Pāṇini to explain this aphorism, while CK is silent.

CK explains the aphorism इखखि (13/11), recognizing the forms and gives supporting aphorisms.

The aphorism मुगानेतः (मुक् आने अतः) (13/27) of the Sarasvata school corresponds to आने मुक् (Pā. 7/2/82).

CK also comments on the succession (अनुवृत्ति) of लुक् from the aphorism लुग्वाऽन्यत्र (13/32) with the remarks: the order of succession should be known from the *sūtrapāṭha*.

AS remarks that the suffix अ of aphorism स्वरादः (13/41) is the exception to the suffix घञ् of the aphorism घञ् भावे (13/38) which shows that the *Sūtrapāṭha* of the Sārasvata school must have employed the परिभाषा - परनित्यान्तरङ्गापवादानामुत्तरोत्तरमं बलियः ।

The aphorism नङ्की (13/45) is wrongly read by editors of *Sārasvataprakriyā* and *Subodhikā* but the indicative इ is inevitable, because it prohibits the functions of गुण and वृद्धि.

AS comments on तव्यानीयौ (13/53) as an aphorism (though not given by NC), however CK explains it i.e. तव्यानीयौ as the aphorism of this school.

The *Sūtrapāṭha* reads स्त्रियां यजां भावे क्तिः (13/57) as स्त्रियां यजां and भावे क्तिः.

The aphorism स्त्रियां यजां भावे क्तिः (13/57) seems to have been accepted by AS and his successors (esp. CK) to get the benefit of the device of splitting of an aphorism (योगविभागः) as two स्त्रियां यजां & भावे क्तिः.

AS takes the word रारः of the aphorism रारो ज्ञसे दृशाम् (13/69) as a case of तन्त्र (the term frequently used in the *Mahābhāṣya*) meaning a usage intended to be adopted in more than one place, though here, रारः stands for रा आरः as well as र अरः.

AS explains the difficult words of the aphorism स्थामी (13/77).

VIII Narendrācārya & Pāṇini – A comparative study

NC's aphorisms are here below closely compared with those of Pāṇini and that too, directly or sometimes through the efforts of AS, CK, RM and JC.

(1) The aphorisms in complete match with those of Pāṇini are:

पाणिनि	नरेन्द्राचार्य
(०१) क्तक्तवतू निष्ठा ॥१/१/२६॥	क्तक्तवतू ॥१३/२३॥
(०२) न क्त्वा सेट् ॥१/२/१८॥	क्तो वा सेट् ॥१२/७८॥
(०३) अनुदात्तङित आत्मनेपदम् ॥१/३/१२॥	आदनुदात्तङितः ॥१२/६९॥
(०४) जनिकर्तुः प्रकृतिः ॥१/४/३०॥	जनिकर्तुः प्रकृतिः ॥८/६॥
(०५) ते प्राग्धातोः ॥१/४/८०॥	प्राग्धातोः ॥११/१५॥
(०६) स नपुंसकम् ॥२/४/१७॥	स नपुंसकम् ॥७/७४॥
(०७) उपमानादाचारे ॥३/१/१०॥	आचार उपमानात् ॥१२/८४॥
(०८) इरितो वा ॥३/१/५७॥	इरितो वां ॥१२/३०॥
(०९) ऋदुपधाच्चाक्लृप्चृतेः ॥३/१/११०॥	ऋदुपधात् क्यप् ॥१३/५६॥
(१०) ओरावश्यके ॥३/१/१२५॥	ओरावश्यके ॥१३/५५॥

(११) द्वितः क्तिः ॥३/३/८८॥	द्वितस्त्रिमक् तत्कृते ॥१३/४३॥
(१२) द्वितोऽथुच् ॥३/३/८९॥	द्वितोऽथुः ॥१३/४२॥
(१३) स्त्रियां क्तिन् ॥३/३/९४॥	स्त्रियां यजां भावे क्तिः ॥१३/५७॥
(१४) गुरोश्च हलः ॥३/३/१०३॥	गुरोर्हसात् ॥१३/५९॥
(१५) षिद्धिदादिभ्योऽङ् ॥३/३/१०४॥	षिद्धिदामङ् ॥१३/५८॥
(१६) नपुंसके भावे क्तः ॥३/३/११४॥	क्तो नपुंसके ॥१३/४५॥
(१७) ईषद्दुःसुषु कृच्छ्राकृच्छ्रार्थेषु खल् ॥३/३/१२६॥	ईषद्दुःसुषु खल्यू ॥१३/५०॥
(१८) समानकर्तृकयोः पूर्वकाले च ॥३/४/२१॥	पूर्वकाले क्त्वा ॥१३/८०॥
(१९) आभीक्ष्ण्ये णमुल् च ॥३/४/२२॥	पौनः पुन्ये णम् पदं द्विशच ॥१३/८३॥
(२०) आतः ॥३/४/११०॥	आतः ॥१२/१११॥
(२१) अव्ययीभावच्च ॥४/३/५९॥	अव्ययीभावात् ॥७/७१॥
(२२) वचिस्वपियजादीनां किति ॥६/१/१५॥	यजां यवराणां य्वृतः सम्प्रसारणं किति ॥१३/७०॥
(२३) ग्रहिज्यावयिव्यधिवष्टिविचतिवृश्चति पृच्छतिभृज्जतीनां डिति च ॥६/१/१६॥	ग्रहां किङिति च ॥१३/७१॥
(२४) ह्रस्वस्य पिति कृति तुक् ॥६/१/७१॥	ह्रस्वस्य पिति कृति तुक् ॥१३/६२॥
(२५) कितः ॥६/१/१६५॥	कितः ॥१२/१६७॥
(२६) सहिवहोरोदवर्णस्य ॥६/३/११२॥	सहिवहोरोदवर्णस्य ॥१३/६६॥
(२७) नामि ॥६/४/३॥	नामि ॥६/६२॥
(२८) नोपधायाः ॥६/४/७॥	नोपधायाः ॥६/५९॥
(२९) भुवो वुग्लुङ्लिटोः ॥६/४/८८॥	भुवो वुक् ॥१२/१७२॥
(३०) आतो धातोः ॥६/४/१४०॥	आतो धातोर्लोपः ॥६/८३॥
(३१) युवोरनाकौ ॥७/१/१॥	युवोरनाकौ ॥१३/६८॥
(३२) शीङो रुट् ॥७/१/६॥	शीङोऽतो रुट् ॥१२/१२६॥
(३३) जसः शी ॥७/१/१७॥	जश्शसोः शि ॥६/७६॥
(३४) इदितो नुम्धातोः ॥७/१/५८॥	इदितो नुम् ॥१२/१५३॥
(३५) अस्थिदधिसक्थ्यक्ष्णामनङ्कुदात्तः ॥७/१/७५॥	अच्चास्थ्नां शसादौ ॥६/७९॥
(३६) पुंसोऽसुङ् ॥७/१/८९॥	पुंसोऽसुङ् ॥६/५४॥
(३७) त्रिचतुरोः स्त्रियां तिसृचतसृ ॥७/२/९९॥	त्रिचतुरोः स्त्रियां तिसृचतसृवत् ॥७/१९॥
(३८) किम कः ॥७/२/१०३॥	किमः कः ॥७/२६॥
(३९) नातः परस्य ॥७/३/२७॥	नातः ॥१२/५३॥

- (४०) प्वादीनां ह्रस्वः ॥७/३/८०॥
 (४१) घेर्ङिति ॥७/३/१११॥
 (४२) कुहोश्चुः ॥७/४/६२॥
 (४३) रीगृदुपधस्य च ॥७/४/९०॥
 (४४) संयोगान्तस्य लोपः ॥८/२/२३॥
 (४५) इट ईटि ॥८/२/२८॥
 (४६) हो ढः ॥८/२/३१॥
 (४७) दूराद्धूते च ॥८/२/८४॥
 (४८) कुप्वोः ऋक ऋपौ च ॥८/३/३७॥
 (४९) वाऽवसाने ॥८/४/५६॥

- प्वादेर्ह्रस्वः ॥१२/१४९॥
 इदुद्भ्याम् ॥६/४१॥
 कुहोश्चुः ॥१२/१०३॥
 रीगृदुपधस्य ॥१२/११३॥
 संयोगान्तस्य लोपः ॥७/४५॥
 इट ईटि ॥१२/३८॥
 हो ढः ॥७/५४॥
 दूराह्वाने टेः प्लुतः ॥१३/८४॥
 कुप्वोः ऋक ऋपौ वा ॥५/२॥
 वाऽवसाने ॥७/६५॥

AS further incorporates almost all the necessary aphorisms of Pāṇini either in toto or with a little alteration.

(2) Some of the aphorisms are incorporated by NC with a slight alteration

पाणिनि

- (१) अलोऽन्त्यात् पूर्व उपधा ॥१/१/६५॥
 (२) कर्तुः क्यङ् सलोपश्च ॥३/१/११॥
 (३) पुषादिद्युताद्यलृदितः परस्मैपदेषु ॥३/१/५५॥
 (४) सार्वधातुके यक् ॥३/१/६७॥
 (५) तुदादिभ्यः शः ॥३/१/७७॥
 (६) रुधादिभ्यः श्नम् ॥३/१/७८॥
 (७) भजो ण्विः ॥३/२/६२॥
 (८) ढ्रलोपे पूर्वस्य दीर्घोऽणः ॥६/३/१११॥
 (९) टाडसिडसामिनात्स्याः ॥७/१/१२॥

- (१०) आमि सर्वनाम्नः सुट् ॥७/१/५२॥
 (११) आने मुक् ॥७/२/८२॥
 (१२) अचो ङिति ॥७/२/११५॥
 (१३) चजोः कु घिण्यतोः ॥७/३/५२॥
 (१४) स्कोः संयोगाद्योरन्ते च ॥८/२/२९॥
 (१५) ल्वादिभ्यः ॥८/२/४४॥
 (१६) उणादि ॥४४८॥

नरेन्द्राचार्य

- अन्त्यात्पूर्व उपधा ॥९/२२॥
 कर्तुर्यङ् ॥१२/८५॥
 लिट्पुषादेर्ङः ॥१२/२९॥
 अप् कर्तरि ॥१२/१०॥
 तुदादेरः ॥१२/१५॥
 रुधादेर्नम् ॥१२/१६॥
 स्वादेर्नुः ॥१३/१४॥
 ढि ढो लोपो दीर्घश्च ॥१३/६५॥

- { डसिरत् ॥६/२०॥
 डस्स्य ॥६/२१॥
 टेन ॥६/२२॥

- सुडामः ॥६/२८॥
 मुगानेतः ॥१३/२७॥
 आदिस्वरस्य ङिति वृद्धिः ॥९/२४॥
 चजोः कगौ घिति ॥१३/६१॥
 स्कोराद्योश्च ॥७/४६॥
 ल्वाद्योदितः ॥१३/७९॥
 लक्षेरीमुट् च ॥१३/८६॥

The close examination of the occurrence of the rules of the Sārasvata school with that of the Pāṇini rules, it can be clearly concluded that

- (1) The aphorisms of a particular topic and its rules have almost the same sequence in the Sārasvata School.
- (2) Pāṇini's 49 aphorisms which are incorporated in the Sārasvata School, prove that these aphorisms are simple as well as easy to understand and possibly, the common students are Sanskrit must have been conversant with these rules in the days of NC and even AS.
- (3) Some of the aphorisms of the Pāṇinian School are incorporated in the Sārasvata School with a slight, but necessary alteration or changing the technical terms. This again indicates the motive of NC to present an easy, simple and perfect system of Sanskrit grammar.

IX Narendrācārya & Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya

The chapters are renamed by Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya (=AS) as under:

No.	Name by Narendrācārya	Name by AS
(1)	संज्ञाप्रकरणम् or संज्ञासन्धि or संज्ञापादः	(१) संज्ञाप्रक्रिया
(२)	स्वरसन्धिः	(२) स्वरसन्धिः
(३)	प्रकृतिभावः	(३) प्रकृतिभावः
(४)	व्यञ्जनसन्धिः	(४) व्यञ्जनसन्धिः
(५)	विसर्गसन्धिः	(५) विसर्गसन्धिः
(६)	विभक्तिपादः	(६) स्वरान्तपुंलिङ्गाः (७) स्वरान्ताः स्त्रीलिङ्गाः (८) स्वरान्त नपुंसकलिङ्गाः (९) हसान्ताः पुंलिङ्गाः (१०) हसान्ताः स्त्रीलिङ्गाः (११) हसान्ताः नपुंसकलिङ्गाः

(७) युष्मदस्मदी	(१२) युष्मदस्मदी
(८) कारकम्	(१३) अनयोरादेशविशेषविधिः
(९) तद्धिताः	(१५) कारकप्रक्रिया
(१०) स्त्रीप्रत्ययाः	(१७) तद्धितप्रक्रिया
(११) समासः	(१४) स्त्रीप्रत्ययाः
(१२) आख्यातः	(१६) समासप्रक्रिया
	(१८-५१) भ्वादिषु-----
	लकारार्थप्रक्रिया
(१३) कृतः	(५२) कर्त्रर्थप्रक्रिया
	(५३) निष्ठाधिकारप्रक्रिया
	(५४) क्स्वादिप्रक्रिया
	(५५) शीलार्थप्रक्रिया
	(५६) उणादिप्रक्रिया
	(५७) भावाधिकारप्रक्रिया
	(५८) कृत्यप्रक्रिया
	(५९) स्यधिकारप्रक्रिया
	(६०) क्त्वादिप्रक्रिया

The above given table shows clearly that NC's 13th Section (i.e. 568 aphorisms) are classified critically and commented upon under the respective topics of the respective chapters. The arrangement of 06 chapters of विभक्तिपादः (6), 34 chapters of आख्यातः (12) and 09 chapters of कृतः (13) is introduced to make the study easier and simpler.

AS commenting on NC's *Sūtrapāṭha* must have observed the operation exposition of *Prakriyā* style as not only all-welcomed and popular but also easier for beginners to grasp and to advance in the grammar. AS influenced by Rāmacandra's *Prakriyā-kaumudī* for such a style of agreement.

(2) The split of an aphorism (योगविभागः) is another

striking factor introduced by AS, naturally from the Paninian school.

This is fully discussed in Ch. 04 later on.

(3) AS explains reasons of the अनुबन्ध like (a) the vowel इ is used for the (easy) pronunciation, while the nasal ङ् indicates the आत्मनेपद of the root चक्ष-चक्षते (1 A - to speak). (b) AS remarks the prohibition of गुण on the strength of the indicatory क्, to which CK adds the support of the aphorism अयकि (12/96).

AS points out the word enjoying succession like, the vowel ई in ईच्चातः (13/55), etc.

X Narendrācārya & Muni Candrakīrti

(1) Candrakīrti (=CK) follows AS in naming the chapters except Ch. 02 called परिभाषाप्रकरणम् which CK might have found extremely necessary for the beginners of this School.

(2) CK explains the grammatical meaning like, प्रकृतिभाव as well as प्रगृह्य. He also presents the difference between the two forms of the word अमी (these or those) अमी (sick or diseased), etc.²⁹

(3) CK reconstructs the following aphorisms:

CK considering the simple and easy set up of the Sārasvata school of Sanskrit grammar recommends to reconstruct the aphorism e.g. एस्मिबहुत्वे। as भिस् एस् like Pāṇini.³⁰

The aphorism याम । इयम् is found differently i.e. यामियम् (B), याम इयम् (B2, P), याम ईयम् (AS and CK) etc. but looking to the application one has to concord all the versions with the result i.e. याम ईयम् (12/49). This School that the mss. B2 and P have maintained the text more correctly.³¹

CK illustrates each member of the group in Genitive plural (सि-स-ता-सी-स्यपाम्) as (1) सि of Imperfect Past, (2) स of Desiderative, (3) ता of First Future, (4) सी of Benidictive and (5) स्यप्-स्य of Second Future.³²

(4) CK furnishes the etymology of the words like, (a) सर्व (all) giving it's etymology as the suffix व applied to the root सृ गतौ. He also gives importance to the परिभाषा “गुरुः शिञ्च सर्वस्य” (under 134) to provide parallel position to the सित् termination of जसः शी (Pā. 7/1/17).³³ (b) The term लिङ्ग as (1) that by which the nouns are recognized as Masculine, Feminine and Neuter and (2) as the nouns only.³⁴ (c) The term “in a compound” (समासे) that (1) ट in बहुव्रीहिः, (2) अ in तत्पुरुषः, (3) ड in द्वन्द्व and (4) क in कर्मधाराय, though the कारिका (taken as interpolation) gives the order as (1) तत्पुरुष, (2) द्वन्द्व, (3) बहुव्रीहिः and (4) कर्मधारय.³⁵ (d) The dropping of टि part of the word विंशति, etc. with the rule of dropping the टि part, while both the editions of the *Sārasvata-prakriyā* read विंशतेस्तिलोपः.³⁶ (e) the term आख्यात (verb) is explained in two ways: (1) through which the forms of the roots are derived (निष्पाद्यन्ते) or (2) those, which express (आचक्षते) the action of the agent.³⁷ (f) The term निपात (indeclinable) as that, which occurs in various senses and furnishes the meaning of the entire group of 65 including 15 vowels.³⁸ (g) The term उपसर्ग (prefix) is explained grammatically as that which is prefixed to the root³⁹ and then he explains each of the prefixes with illustration.⁴⁰

XI Narendrācārya & Rāmāśrama

AS's explanation is short and perfect. The same style is followed by Rāmāśrama (=RM).

AS is exact in furnishing the well-known (Pāṇinian) technical terms like प्रत्याहार and justifies the Non-coalescing (असन्धि) of the vowels in the aphorism, to which RM adopts the same explanation.⁴¹

RM replacing सजातीय (homogeneous) for सर्वणः makes his explanation short.⁴² RM does not suffice any importance to its explanation here ए ऐ ओ औ सन्ध्यक्षराणि (1/3).⁴³ AS enumerates nine (five समान + four सन्ध्यक्षर) vowels and paraphrases उभये (both) RM combines the aphorisms 3 and 4.

RM reads य्योः explaining it as Ablative Singular of यु (इ and उ).⁴⁴

XII Narendrācārya & Jinacandra

Jinacandra (=JC) introducing the सवर्णसंज्ञा illustrates the three varieties of अ as अ आ आः and instructs to understand the rest in this manner.⁴⁵

JC gives simple explanation ए ऐ ओ औ सन्ध्यक्षराणि (१/३) - ए ऐ ओ औ एते चत्वारो वर्णाः सन्ध्यक्षरसंज्ञाः स्युः ।

JC following AS divides the aphorism into two⁴⁶ seem to read two aphorisms, but the Ms. of *Sārasvatasūtrapāṭha* reads both the aphorisms as one. CK specifically points out the division of the aphorism into two.⁴⁷

Conclusion

The editor of CK's *Subodhikā* remarks in the note (p 47) that these lines are elaborated in *Manoramā* (of Bhaṭṭojidīkṣita) (Which seems to be the case of latter evidence).

AS anticipating the wrong recognition explains *yyoh* as the dual form of यु (dual) of ई and ऊ which is supported by *Bhoja-vyākaraṇam* and *Viḍvadcintāmaṇi*. While CK the editor of *Subodhikā* (wrongly rectifies AS's texts) and Rāmāśrama read योः (6/37) explaining it as Ablative singular of यु (ई and ऊ).

The editor (or commentator) of *Subodhikā* changes the order of words and hence the order of aphorism.

He further substitutes सः for पदान्ते च, though the former occurs by way of succession and the latter is un- available in the aphorism.

The editor of *Subodhikā* gives this aphorism with bold letters at both the place (pp. 108 & 191), but the first occurrence must be normal, while the second occurrence is to be taken proper place. The reason is quite clear, because CK recognises the words of aphorism here only.

The editor of *Subodhikā* has unknowingly dropped the word *tatpuruṣa* from the aphorism अमादौ तत्पुरुषः (S. 252), though CK reads and comments on it.

The editor of *Subodhikā* (P 254) does not incorporate some of the lines of *Sārasvata-prakriyā*, prior and posterior to aphorism सहादेः सादिः (under S. 260).

The editor of *Sārasvata-prakriyā* seems to have some miscodex, the version of अन्यार्थे (7/22) and पुंवद्वा (11/10) is interchanged and as a result, the commentary is also mixed up.

The editor reads here द्विश्च as an aphorism, which is commented like an aphorism by CK, but the *Sūtrakāra* does not include it because the next aphorism स्वरादेः परः (12/100) gives the same rule.

CK and the editor of *Subodhikā* present ध्वे च सेर्लोपः as an aphorism, but in this situation the aphorism लोपो ह्रस्वाज्ज्ञसे (12/37) is proper, because it gets the succession from the aphorism सेः (12/36).

The editor of *Subodhikā* reads different version from एध वृद्धौ to ऐधत (under S. 383).

The editor of *Subodhikā* wrongly reads आगमः in place of अडागमः, though he continues the explanation with लित् (and not मित्) (under S. 395).

All the editors omit the aphorism असादेश्वर्दिः (12/139), but considering its proper place, it is taken in its contextual occurrence.

All the editors read this aphorism रुदादेर्दृ (12/35) as रुदादेः and take it in applying इत् and अद्. But there is no succession (अनुवृत्ति) of अद्, so the aphorism must be taken as it is in the *Sūtrapāṭha*.

The editor of the *Sārasvata-prakriyā* reads शकृत्स्तम्ब-वातापिः of the aphorism इखखि (S. 485) in the next aphorism खितिपदस्य (under S. 486).

The editor of the *Sārasvata-prakriyā* has misplaced some lines, which are placed with the help of the *Sārasvata-vyākaraṇam Subodhikā* by Shastri Navalakisora.

The editor of *Subodhikā* suggests the correction क्त for तक् of the aphorism AS and CK, while CK himself takes it as तक् only without mentioning any correction.

The editor of *Subodhikā* does not read the aphorism हबक्त्योः (under S. 551), but the editor of *Sārasvataprakriyā* reads.

The problem of the original text (सूत्रक्रम) and the commented text (प्रक्रियाक्रम) as it is noted in Mahopādhyāya Vinayasāgara's *Bhoja-vyākaraṇam* seems stronger not only on the ground of the remarks of the editor of *Bhoja-vyākaraṇam*, but also on the close examination of the occurrence of the corrective statements (वार्त्तिक) in their original order (edited here, Part - II study, pp. 215-218) and their order of application.

Their sequence is not maintained. As e.g. स्वरे परे (वा 84).

AS's explanation is short and perfect.

CK on the other hand elaborates the aphorism furnishing the etymology and grammatical forms of the technical term of समान.

CK incorporates the necessary aphorisms from Pāṇini, indicated in the *Sārasvata-prakriyā*.⁴⁸

CK quoting *Prakriyā-kaumudī* provides the example, is the proof for Sārasvata system of Sanskrit grammar

being supported by the aphorisms of Pāṇini.⁴⁹

The same style is accepted by RM.

JC's explanation is in brief.



- 1 येनाक्षरसमाम्नायमधिगम्य महेश्वरात् ।
कृत्स्नं व्याकरणं प्रोक्तं तस्मै पाणिनये नमः ॥ पा° शि° ५७ ॥
- 2 Belvelkar S. K., P 45 & 95.
- 3 शुभामित्येनन स्वकपोलकल्प नानिरासः कृतः ॥ सु° उत्तरार्धम्, पृ° ३११ ॥
- 4 इतिश्रीनरेन्द्राचार्यसारस्वते क्षेमेन्द्रकृतं टिप्पणं समाप्तम् ॥ बेल्वलकर, पृ° ९५ ॥
- 5 Belvelkar, pp. 99-100.
- 6 यन्नरेन्द्रनगरिप्रभाषितं यच्च वैमलसरस्वतीरितम् ।
तन्मयात्र लिखितं तथाधिकं किञ्चिदेव कलितं स्वया धिया ॥ बेल्वलकर, पृ° ९५ ॥
- 7 Vide. Belvelkar, P 44 and Abhyankar K. V. & Shukla J. M., P 327.
- 8 Belvelkar, pp. 101-102.
- 9 सारस्वत व्याकरणम् । श्री चन्द्रकीर्तिसूरिप्रणीतचन्द्रकीर्तिनाम्न्या सुबोधिकया व्याख्याया,
श्रीवासुदेवभट्टविरचितप्रसादाख्यटीकया च समन्वितम् ॥ सं. यास्क-श्रीनवलकिशोरशास्त्रि, भूमिका, पृ°-
०९ ॥
- 10 Abhyankar & Shukla, P 161.
- 11 वन्दे ब्रह्म शिव वन्दे वन्दे देवीं सरस्वतीम् ।
लक्ष्मी वन्दे हरिं वन्दे वन्दे सिद्धार्थदेवताः ॥ १/१ ॥
- 12 M.M.Vinaysāgarin in his *Bhoj^ovyākaraṇam* P 343. Ascribing the *uṇādi* to Pāṇini mentions clearly their inclusion from the *uṇādi* aphorisms of Pāṇini, which may be taken as, from the *uṇādi* aphorisms (or Śākaṭāyana) included in the Pāṇinian School of Sanskrit Grammar.
- 13 Cp. संयोगान्तस्य लोपः ॥ पा° ८/२/२३ ॥
- 14 Vide. Appendix – 02.
- 15 *Bhoja-vyākaraṇam* (a) Intro. P 21, (b) P 66, (c) note P 425 and (d) *Sūtrapāṭha* (*Bhoja-vyākaraṇam*) P 556.
- 16 Vide. FN 11 above.
- 17 सज्ञासन्धिर्विभक्तिश्च युष्मदस्मच्च कारकम् ।

- तद्धितः स्त्री समासश्च दशधाख्यातमिष्यते ॥ १/२ ॥
 कृतश्च प्रत्यया धातोर्विभक्त्यन्तं पदं स्मृतम् ।
 वाक्यं तत्समुदायश्च सा वाक्कामधुगुच्यते ॥ १/३ ॥
- 18 केचित्तु आद्यान्ताभ्यामित्येकपदं सूत्रं पृथक् मन्यन्ते ॥ सू० ६, १/६ ॥
- 19 It is interesting to note that NC furnishes 33 aphorisms of the Pāṇinian school, which expresses the simplicity of the Sārasvata school and also fact that the uses of the cases (of Sanskrit grammar) had become known to the beginners.
- 20 न पतति पिता यस्मात् तदपत्यं तस्मिन् ॥ सू० २६९, ९/१ ॥
- 21 इत्युणादिसूत्रोक्तोऽसप्रत्ययः ॥ सू० २८५, ९/१४ ॥
- 22 टश्च तत्पुरुषे शेषो ह्यकारो द्वन्द्व एव च ।
 डकारस्तु बहुव्रीहौ ककारो नियमो मतः ॥ सू० पूर्वार्द्धे पृ० २५९ ॥
- 23 NC does not included the Vedic लट्-लकार and hence he has 09 conjugations. Among these 09 he has separated Benedictine and omitted to give the suffixes of the Aorist, the second future and the Conditional moods, in the aphorisms 12/24, 12/20 and 12/23 respectively.
- 24 NC follows the serial order of the 10 conjugations, while Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya, Muni Candrakīrti, Rāmāśrama and Jinacandra discusses the wellknown conjugations तुदादि (6th), रुधादि (7th) and तनादि (8th) in a little different sequence i.e. रुधादि (6th), तनादि (7th) and तुदादि (8th).
- 25 It is not clear from where the augment अट् (अ) occurs. Anubhūtiśvarūpācārya and the commentators writes “another augment आट् (आ)” which means that they take अट् (अ) + आट् (आ) = आट् (आ). But the aphorism can be simply reconstructed as स्वरादेरट् (स्वर-आदेः अट्) or अट् स्वरादेः or स्वरादेरट् च (स्वर - आदेः अट् च), because there is no possibility of the augment अट्. It can be also taken on the line of the *Paribhāṣ. ā* – व्याख्यानतो विशेषप्रतिपत्तिर्न हि संदेहादलक्षम् (परि० १) ।
- 26 It is interesting to note that NC furnishes almost 65 aphorisms of Pāṇini's *Āatmanepada-prakriyā* in only 01 aphorism, which expresses the simplicity of the Sārasvata school. For details, cf. Part-II, (Text), chap. II. 32.
- 27 उपधाया लघोः अनेन गुणे प्राप्ते नानिटि से न अनिटि से ॥ सू० ३७९, १२/१२८ ॥

- 28 सूत्रस्य सुगमत्वाद्ध्याख्यानस्यानावश्यकत्वम्, तथापि सूत्रस्यास्य चन्द्रिकायां व्याख्यानं कृतमस्ति ॥ सू० ३५३, १२/१७१॥
- 29 अ. प्रकृतेर्भावः भवनं सत्ता प्रकृतिभावः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ४४ ॥
ब. संधियोग्या अपि स्वराः केचित्प्रकृतिस्था एव तिष्ठन्ति ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ४४ ॥
- 30 अत्र तु भिस् एस् इति सूत्रकरणं युक्तम् ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ७३ ॥
- 31 याम ईयम् ॥ १२.४९ ॥
- 32 सि भूते सिः । स इति इच्छार्थः सः । ता श्वस्तनार्थेऽष्टादशको गणः । सी सीष्ट सीयास्तामित्यादिः आशीरर्थात्मनेपदे नवक्त्रे गणः । स्यप् भविष्यत् क्रियातिपत्त्योः ॥ सु० उत्तरार्द्धं पृ० २० ॥
- 33 अ. सर्व । सू गतौ । वप्रत्ययः । सरति प्रसरतीति सर्वः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ८० ॥
ब. अनेकालसित् सर्वस्य ॥ पा० १/१/५५ ॥
- 34 अ. लिङ्ग्यन्ते चिह्नयन्ते ज्ञायन्ते पुंस्त्रीनपुंसकतया शब्दा अनेनेति लिंगम् ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २०६ ॥
ब. नामेव लिंगम् इति कौमाराः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २०६ ॥
- 35 अ. तत्पुरुषे विभक्तिलोपे कविराजन् टप्रत्ययः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २६० ॥
ब. समासे इति बहुव्रीहौ तत्पुरुषे द्वन्द्वे कर्मधारये च ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २६० ॥
क. टश्च तत्पुरुषे ज्ञेयो ह्यकारो द्वन्द्व एव च । डकारस्तु बहुव्रीहौ ककारो नियमो मतः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २५९ ॥
- 36 अ. द्वितीये डप्रत्ययः । डानुबन्धेऽन्त्यस्वरादेर्लोपः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ३०१ ॥
ब. प्रक्रियायां ति विंशतेर्दिति विंशतेर्मस्य तिश्चब्दस्य लोपः स्यात् डिति परे । यद्वा केचित्तु टिलोपे कृते पुनः हलादेरीषाक्तइति टिलोपमिच्छन्ति केचित्तु टिलोपे कृते सहादेः सादिः इति विंशति इत्यस्य विंश इत्यादेशमिच्छन्ति ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ३०१ ॥
- 37 आख्यायन्ते कथ्यन्ते अर्थात् निष्पाद्यन्ते भ्वादीनां रूपाणि येन तदाख्यातम् । अथवा आख्यान्ति आचक्षते कर्तुर्व्यापारमित्याख्याताः ॥ सु० उत्तरार्द्धं पृ० ०१ ॥
- 38 अ. Cp. निरुक्तम् १.४ - अथ निपाता उच्चावचेश्वर्येषु निपतन्ति ।
ब. सुबोधिका पूर्वार्द्धं पृ० १८२ ॥
- 39 उपसृज्यतेधातोः समीपे क्रियते इत्युपसर्गः ॥ सु० पू० पृ० १८७ ॥
- 40 निर निश्चयनिगमनातिशयनिषेधनिर्णयादौ । निर्णयति निर्गतः निरुपमः निष्पन्नः निश्चयः निर्ममिकम् । दुरिति दुष्टे दुःखकष्टाद्यर्थे । दुर्जनः दुष्करम् ॥ सु० पू० पृ० १८७ ॥
- 41 अ. अनेन प्रत्याहारग्रहणाय वर्णाः परिगण्यन्ते ॥ सु० पू० पृ० ०९ ॥
ब. अइउऋलृ समानाः ॥ १.१ ॥
- 42 ह्रस्वदीर्घप्लुतभेदाः सवर्णाः ॥ १.२ ॥
- 43 अ ऐ ओ औ सन्ध्यक्षराणि ॥ १.३ ॥
- 44 स्त्रियां य्वोः ॥ ६.३७ ॥
- 45 इ यं स्वरे ॥ २.१ ॥
- 46 Though the editor of the printed text of AS's *Sārasvata-prakriyā* gives separate numbering of each of the group making 6-13 aphorisms.

- 47 केचित्तु आद्यान्ताभ्यामित्येकपदं सूत्रं पृथक् मन्यन्ते ॥ सु० पू० पृ० १६ ॥
- 48 तद्धितप्रत्यये परे यथा उपगोरपत्यमित्यत्र षष्ठीलोपः । कृत्प्रत्यये यथा कुम्भ करोतीत्यत्र द्वितीयावर्तमानार्थयोर्लोपः । इति सूत्रेण अमो लुक् । ततो निमित्तापाये नैमित्तिकस्याप्यभावः इति वचनात् इयोऽपि निषेधः । स्त्रीशब्दः प्रकृत एव तिष्ठति । अधि स्त्री इति जातम् । ततः कृत्तद्धितसमासाश्च (पा० १/२/४६) इति समासस्य नामसंज्ञा ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २३९ ॥
- 49 मध्येसमुद्रं पारेगङ्गमित्यादि लोकज्ज्ञेयम् । अत उक्तं प्रक्रियाकौमुद्याम्-अव्यय विभक्तिसमीप-समृद्धिवृद्ध्यर्थाभावात्पयासम्प्रतिशब्दप्रादुर्भावपश्चाद्ययानुपूर्व्ययौगपद्यसादृश्यसम्पत्तिसाकल्यान्तवचनेषु (पा० २/१/६) अव्ययीभावः इति ॥ सु० पू० पृ० २४० ॥